

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO

- - - - -
Coordination Proceeding)
Special Title (Rule 1550(b)).)
In re TOBACCO CASES II)
This Document Relates to:)
) JCCP No. 4042
The People of the State of)
California, and American)
Environmental Safety Institute) DEPOSITION OF
v. Philip Morris Incorporated,)
et al., Los Angeles Superior) THOMAS BONFIGLIO
Court, Case No. BC 194217)
The People of the State of)
California, City of San Jose,)
and Paul Dowhall v. Brown &)
Williamson Corp., et al., San)
Francisco Superior Court, Case)
No. 996781)
)
SERVICE LIST "B")
- - - - -

C O N F I D E N T I A L T R A N S C R I P T

TAKEN ON: Thursday, June 8, 2000

TAKEN AT: 401 B Street, Suite 1700
San Diego, California

REPORTED BY: Jeannette K. Jessup
CSR No. 8573, RPR

1 APPEARANCES:

2 FOR PLAINTIFFS IN THE PEOPLE OF CALIFORNIA/AESI:

3 THORSNES, BARTOLOTTA & MCGUIRE
2550 Fifth Avenue, Eleventh Floor
4 San Diego, California 92103

5 BY: JOHN F. MCGUIRE, ESQ.

6

FOR DEFENDANT: BROWN & WILLIAMSON TOBACCO COMPANY

7

SEDGWICK DETERT MORAN & ARNOLD

8 801 S. Figueroa Street, 18th Floor
 Los Angeles, California 90017

9 BY: WENDY A. TUCKER, ESQ.

10

11 FOR DEFENDANT: LORILLARD TOBACCO COMPANY, ET AL.

12 GRAY CARY WARE & FREIDENRICH
 401 B Street, Suite 1700
 13 San Diego, California 92101

14 BY: WILLIAM N. KAMMER, ESQ.
 BY: BRIAN A. FOSTER, ESQ.

15

16 FOR DEFENDANT: PHILIP MORRIS TOBACCO COMPANY

17 SELTZER, CAPLAN, MCMAHON & VITEK
 750 B Street, Suite 2100
 18 San Diego, California 92101

19 BY: DANIEL E. EATON, ESQ.

20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25
 26
 27
 28

2

1 I N D E X

2	WITNESS	EXAMINED BY	PAGE
3	THOMAS BONFIGLIO		
4		Mr. McGuire	8
5		Lunch recess	119
6	Confidential sections bound separately:		
7	98-119, 121-198, 200-212, 213-225		

8 E X H I B I T S

9	NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
10	4049	Notice of Deposition.....	61
11	4052	Amended Notice of Deposition.....	61
12	4053	7-Eleven R.J.R. Marketing Initiatives, 2-17-99.....	98
13		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
14	4054	Memo dated May 3, 2000 to Ms. Swisher from Mr. Bonfiglio.....	121

16		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)
17	4055	Letter dated August 5, 1998 to Ms. Lopez from Mr. Stevens..... 135
18		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)
19	4056	Key Findings for Doral versus GCP..... 136
20		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)
21	4057	7-Eleven Top to Top Meeting, 2-23-2000 138
22		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)
23	4058	7-Eleven and Philip Morris Partnering for Success, 2-3-2000..... 154
24		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)
25		
26	4059	Trade Counsel presentation, 4-2-98.... 160
27		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)
28		

3

1 E X H I B I T S

2	NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
3	4060	Trade Counsel presentation, 1999.....	163
4		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
5	4061	Building the Business at 7-Eleven presentation, 1-7-2000.....	166
6		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
7	4062	Retail Leaders 2000, December 1999....	171
8		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
9	4063	Memo dated May 10, 2000 to 7-Eleven re: Increase in Philip Morris Retail Leaders RDA Payments.....	181
10		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
11			
12	4064	Memo dated May 1, 2000 to several people from Mr. Bonfiglio.....	182
13		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
14			
15	4065	Philip Morris Retail Leaders Agreement	182
16		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
17	4066	Memo dated January 6, 2000 from Mr. Bonfiglio to Mr. Rose and Mr. Podeschi	183
18		(Document is designated	

19		confidential and bound separately)	
20	4067	1999 Retail Leaders Growth Fund Changes.....	184
21		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
22	4068	Southland Retail Leaders Discussion, 10-21-98.....	184
23		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
24	4069	R.J. Reynolds/7-Eleven Doral House Brand Strategy.....	186
25		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
26			
27			
28			

4

1	E X H I B I T S		
2	NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
3	4070	Letter dated June 28, 1999 from Philip Morris regarding Retail Leaders Program.....	187
4		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
5			
6	4071	New Retail Display Agreements, 7-1-99.	188
7		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
8	4072	Letter dated August 18, 1999 to Mr. French from Mr. Bonfiglio.....	191
9		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
10	4073	Philip Morris National Retail Leaders presentation, 10-98.....	192
11		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
12			
13	4074	Cigarette Program Comparisons.....	192
14		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
15	4075	Retail Leaders Agreement.....	194
16		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
17	4076	Memo dated May 15, 2000 from Mr. Bongiflio with Copy of New Agreement.....	194
18		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
19	4077	Daily/Weekly Planner.....	195
20		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
21			

22	4078	Mclane Southwest New Costs/Additional Taxes.....	195
23		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
24	4079	Mclane Pacific New Costs/Additional Taxes.....	196
25		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
26	4080	Franchise Tax Board document request..	197
27		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
28			

5

1 E X H I B I T S

2	NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
3	4081	New Cigarette Display and Merchandising Programs, 7-1-99.....	200
4		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
5	4082	One-page note regarding business and taxpayers for fair fees.....	206
6		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
7			
8	4083	Several e-mails from May of 2000.....	206
9		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
10	4084	Letter dated January 29, 1999 from Mr. Volkening to Mr. McElroy.....	208
11		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
12	4085	Todd McElroy Position Statement dated February 2, 1999.....	209
13		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
14			
15	4086	Activity report.....	209
16		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
17	4087	Memo dated April 6, 2000 to Mr. Payne from Mr. Mazingo.....	211
18		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
19	4088	Local issues activity.....	212
20		(Document is designated confidential and bound separately)	
21			

QUESTION WITNESS INSTRUCTED NOT TO ANSWER

22	PAGE	LINE
	28	8
23	60	5
	61	1
24	74	2

	74	10
25	74	15
	74	22
26	74	28
	76	13
27	82	17
	84	2
28	105	8
	225	16

6

1 ////
 2 ////
 3 ////
 4 ////
 5 ////
 6 ////
 7 ////
 8 ////
 9 ////
 10 ////
 11 ////
 12 ////
 13 ////
 14 ////
 15 ////
 16 ////
 17 ////
 18 ////
 19 ////
 20 ////
 21 ////
 22 ////

23 (Whereupon, the following testimony is deemed
 24 confidential material and subject to protective order
 25 entered by the Superior Court of the County of Los
 26 Angeles, State of California and is bound separately.)
 27 (Exhibit 4053 was marked for identification.)
 28 ////

98

1 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
 2 Q. Exhibit 4053 for identification says 7-Eleven
 3 Marketing Initiatives, February 17, 1999. How would you
 4 describe this document?
 5 MR. EATON: Before we go further, I'd like, at
 6 this point, to designate this as attorneys eyes only.
 7 Both the exhibit and the discussion of the exhibit.
 8 MR. KAMMER: This is under --
 9 MR. EATON: Pursuant to the protective order.
 10 MR. MCGUIRE: We challenge that. We're going to
 11 challenge any of the historic information as being for
 12 anybody's eyes only. It's old.
 13 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
 14 Q. Is this in the public domain, this document?
 15 A. I'm sorry. I don't know what you mean by public
 16 domain.
 17 Q. Is it readily available for people in the
 18 company to see?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Is it an historic document?
 21 MR. EATON: Vague as to "historic."
 22 THE WITNESS: Is this an historic document?
 23 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
 24 Q. Uh-huh.

25 A. I'm sorry. I'm not trying to be cute. What do
26 you mean by "historic"?
27 Q. Does this talk about something -- an
28 accomplished fact?

99

1 A. It talks about things that may or may not have
2 become accomplished facts.
3 Q. Okay. But does it talk about anything that's
4 going to happen in the future?
5 MR. EATON: Calls for speculation and vague.
6 THE WITNESS: Doesn't appear to, no.
7 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
8 Q. Okay. Does this say R.J.R Marketing
9 Initiatives? Does Philip Morris know what's in this
10 document, if you know?
11 MR. EATON: Lacks foundation.
12 THE WITNESS: I don't think so. Specifically.
13 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
14 Q. What's the distribution on this document in the
15 company?
16 A. To me and possibly, depending upon where this
17 was presented, my boss might have been at this meeting.
18 Q. Who else?
19 A. In our company?
20 Q. Yeah.
21 A. Probably no one else.
22 Q. What's the purpose of the document?
23 A. The purpose of the document is presentation from
24 Reynolds to us about suggested plans for 1999.
25 Q. And did this form the basis of an agreement that
26 was ultimately entered into between you and R.J.
27 Reynolds? By "you," I mean the company.
28 A. I'm sorry. Could you repeat that.

100

1 Q. Did this document form the basis of an
2 agreement, marketing agreement regarding sale of R.J.
3 Reynolds cigarettes by 7-Eleven stores, both company and
4 franchise?
5 A. Parts of it may have been, yeah, may have been
6 adopted.
7 Q. How will we know which things were adopted and
8 which weren't?
9 A. I could probably tell you that.
10 Q. As we go through it?
11 A. Yeah.
12 Q. Did you participate in receiving this
13 presentation and then determining what would be
14 acceptable for your company?
15 A. Yes.
16 Q. Okay. Did you eventually sign a contract
17 between you and Reynolds regarding how R.J. Reynolds'
18 cigarettes would be marketed in 7-Eleven stores?
19 A. Yes. But I don't think this document goes to
20 that.
21 Q. Okay. What does this document go to?
22 A. This is -- I would call this a promotion plan.
23 Q. Okay.
24 A. Under an agreement that had already been signed.
25 Q. Okay. So an agreement was signed that had --
26 where the parties agree that the details of how the
27 marketing would be implemented would be developed at a
28 later date. Is that accurate?

101

1 A. Yeah. I'm not sure details is accurate. It's
2 more than details.
3 Q. How would you --
4 A. Key elements.
5 Q. Key elements would be determined later?
6 A. Right.
7 Q. And then this is their -- this is Reynolds'
8 presentation as to how they think the key elements should
9 be determined; is that accurate?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. Okay. And you accepted some of their
12 presentation and rejected others?
13 A. I would have to go through the document one by
14 one on this one to see if any or all of it had been
15 accepted.
16 Q. Okay. When it says on the second page, "2Q99,"
17 that means second quarter '99?
18 A. Yes, sir.
19 Q. And a value-added program means what to you?
20 A. Value-added program is generally what we call
21 buy-somes, buy two, get one free, buy two, get one free.
22 Possibly a coupon for price reduction.
23 Q. What's a participation rate?
24 A. Number of stores that actually participate in
25 the recommended promotion.
26 Q. Is there a financial incentive to 7-Eleven,
27 Incorporated, if based on the number of franchisees that
28 participate?

102

1 A. No, not directly. I mean our contract calls for
2 us to recommend that they participate and to encourage
3 recommendation.
4 Q. How do you do that?
5 A. Communication of what the value-added offer is,
6 trying to describe to them what we think it may do in
7 terms of cement a relationship with their customers, like
8 being the place to come where there is value. Sales.
9 Q. Based on your historical experience with these
10 programs, is that what you mean?
11 A. Yes.
12 Q. By sales? Do you basically tell the franchisees
13 your sales are going to be linked somehow to these
14 programs, they work?
15 A. Yes.
16 Q. Okay. There is an arrow that says "Corporate
17 Philip Morris Exclusive Accounts." What does that mean?
18 A. I have to go look at the page.
19 Q. Okay. We'll get to it then. "Camel 99's
20 Introduction, Expansion Markets," what does that refer
21 to?
22 A. A line extension of a particular packing of
23 cigarettes that had not been available for distribution
24 in all parts of the country and they were expanding a
25 distribution and wanted us to recommend the items to our
26 stores.
27 Q. Going up one, "Doral Ultra Lights, Box 83 and
28 100." And then says "National Introduction." Is this

103

1 also a line extension?
2 A. It's a type of cigarette that prior to that was
3 only in soft pack. Now being made available in hard box
4 as well.
5 Q. Box 83, what does that mean?

6 A. 83 is king size. 100 is 100's. It's lengths.
7 83 millimeter, 100 millimeter.
8 Q. Is there a difference between a Doral Light and
9 an Ultra Light?
10 MR. EATON: Calls for speculation.
11 THE WITNESS: Once again, my understanding is
12 it's only in how strong a flavor profile the brand has,
13 the taste has.
14 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
15 Q. Does lights and ultra lights have that
16 designation, have something to do with the amount of tar
17 that the consumer is exposed to in lighting up and
18 smoking the cigarette?
19 MR. EATON: Same objection.
20 THE WITNESS: I'm not sure.
21 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
22 Q. Do you find the description of light and ultra
23 light to be vague and confusing to yourself?
24 MR. EATON: Same objection.
25 THE WITNESS: My understanding is it's just the
26 flavor that you get. A strong smoke taste as opposed to
27 a lighter smoke taste.
28 ////

104

1 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
2 Q. You agree that this could be confusing to your
3 consumers, as to what the difference between a light and
4 an ultra light is?
5 A. Doesn't seem to be.
6 Q. What do you base that on, your response on?
7 A. There weren't any questions asked.
8 Q. You haven't heard any questions asked. Have you
9 conducted a survey in your stores to determine whether or
10 not the consumer needs to have described for them what,
11 in fact, is the difference between a light and an ultra
12 light? If I want to reduce my exposure to tar, do I go
13 to a light cigarette or an ultra light cigarette, or am I
14 getting the same exposure no matter what I go to, and
15 this light and ultra light isn't going to help me one
16 bit?
17 MR. KAMMER: I object to the form of the
18 question. And also the fact that it exceeds the scope of
19 the topics, and instruct the witness not to answer.
20 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
21 Q. What's the Winston "No Bull" promotion?
22 A. That was tied to a sweepstakes, tied to Nascar
23 event.
24 Q. And would you explain Item Number 6, what that
25 stands for?
26 A. We'd have to really look at the document.
27 Q. Okay. We have a promotional schedule, the term
28 sku's, s-k-u-s, is used. What does that mean?

105

1 A. It's a stock keeping unit. It's an item.
2 Q. And what is the stock keeping unit that this
3 would refer to, Winston packs or cartons?
4 A. In this case it would refer to actually two
5 packs.
6 Q. And does VAP through Mclane mean value-added
7 price through Mclane, the distributor you discussed
8 earlier?
9 A. It's not price, no. It's value-added provider,
10 provided. How do I explain this? Value added. It

11 stands for value added promotion. I'm sorry.
12 Value-added promotion. And what this says is that the
13 stores that purchase through Mclanes are recommended they
14 will have available for those stores a Winston offer of
15 \$1 off two packs, which is the nationally recommended
16 7-Eleven offer.

17 Q. Okay. And if you --

18 A. Yeah. Sorry.

19 Q. I'm sorry. Did you finish?

20 A. The stores do not normally -- do not purchase
21 cigarettes -- our stores that do not purchase cigarettes
22 from Mclanes, which would be some of our franchise
23 stores, they would have a different offer below them.

24 Q. Is that the offer right below that?

25 A. Yeah. The Camel, buy two, get one free or
26 possibly, the Winston, buy two, get one free.

27 Q. Does Mclane provide the promotional or the
28 buy-down money?

106

1 A. No.

2 Q. That comes directly from R.J. Reynolds?

3 A. Comes directly from the manufacturer involved,
4 yes.

5 Q. What's PRP stand for under February, as you work
6 your way down that column? Do you see where I am?

7 A. Yeah. Retail -- got to be honest with you, I'm
8 not sure exactly what they call it, but it's a buy-down.
9 It's a price reduction period, I believe is what they
10 call it.

11 Q. Okay. And if we work further down to February,
12 the last column we have POS/PDI. POS is point of sale;
13 is that right?

14 A. Yeah. Synonymous with POP.

15 Q. Okay. Point of purchase, same as point of sale.
16 And what about PDI, what does that mean?

17 A. That would be an insert or a direct mail.

18 Q. To who?

19 A. To consumers.

20 Q. So is this -- how does that work?

21 A. R.J. Reynolds in this case has a mailing list of
22 smokers that they have on file that have given them and
23 provided them with age verification, et cetera, who they
24 mail announcements to regarding offers and special
25 retails.

26 Q. And does 7-Eleven, Incorporated, its name or
27 corporate logo, appear on this --

28 A. Yeah.

107

1 Q. -- mailer?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Does it basically say during the month of
4 February, if you take this into your local 7-Eleven
5 store, you'll get some benefit in purchasing cigarettes?

6 A. Just an announcement that it's available.

7 Q. So you don't have to take it any place?

8 A. No.

9 Q. You said it's a mailing list of smokers who have
10 been -- I don't remember your exact words, but you said
11 age verified or something like that. What do you
12 understand about that?

13 A. That over the years R.J. Reynolds has developed
14 a mailing list of people who have filled out a form at
15 some point in time indicating they are of age, provided

16 them with copy of the driver's license, et cetera, and
17 have stated and signed that they wanted to receive these
18 types of notifications.
19 Q. Who told you that it involves that procedure?
20 A. R.J. Reynolds.
21 Q. Who at R.J. Reynolds?
22 A. Who? Gosh --
23 Q. J.S. Rumberger?
24 A. No. This is in there -- they have a -- I can't
25 remember the gentleman's name. There was somebody in
26 charge of their direct mail program in Reynolds.
27 Q. How long ago did that represent -- was that
28 representation made?

108

1 A. First time, probably about three years ago and
2 has been made in conversations several times since then.
3 Q. So your understanding is, does this apply in
4 California as well?
5 A. I'm not sure. It's restricted in some states,
6 but I'm not sure.
7 Q. Your understanding, though, is that R.J.
8 Reynolds has a list of smokers that they have verified
9 are smokers that they can send promotional material to?
10 A. That's correct.
11 Q. So there would be no excuse for them to send
12 promotional material to anyone else, would there?
13 MR. EATON: Calls for speculation.
14 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
15 Q. Like free cigarettes?
16 MR. EATON: Same objection.
17 THE WITNESS: I don't think they can.
18 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
19 Q. What do you base that on?
20 A. You mean just sampling people?
21 Q. Yes.
22 A. They're not allowed to sample.
23 Q. What do you base that on?
24 A. What I've been told is what they've agreed to.
25 Q. Who told you that?
26 A. I couldn't give you a name. I think I've heard
27 it from several of the companies that that was one of the
28 things they agreed not to do is sample.

109

1 Q. Did R.J. Reynolds violate that agreement?
2 A. Not that I'm aware of.
3 Q. Being sued by the attorney general of the state
4 of California for violating that agreement?
5 A. Not that I'm aware of. I have no knowledge of
6 that.
7 Q. Is there someone at 7-Eleven that's kind of
8 checking on their partners in business here to see if, in
9 fact, that they are following the law, so that you would
10 know whether or not the attorney general has determined
11 that they haven't?
12 A. I would assume that our government affairs
13 department would learn of that. But I'm not aware that
14 that's the case.
15 Q. Have you ever asked?
16 A. Asked who?
17 Q. The government affairs department as to whether
18 or not R.J. Reynolds can be trusted to follow what they
19 tell you they're doing, complying with the law.
20 A. I've never made that specific -- I've never

21 asked them that specific question.
22 MS. TUCKER: And also it assumes facts not in
23 evidence. Not that they shouldn't be trusted, but that
24 he had a conversation with them about that.
25 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
26 Q. Have you read any newspaper articles about the
27 attorney general of the state of California suing R.J.
28 Reynolds Tobacco Company for sending 300,000 cigarettes
110
1 to unknown addresses or addresses, where they knew
2 nothing about whether there were minors involved or not?
3 A. No.
4 Q. When you go back home, will you ask government
5 affairs whether they know anything about that?
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Okay. Let's turn to the next page. What does
8 Ex-Red mean, if you know?
9 A. Yeah. They have a brand called Kamel Red.
10 That's actually spelled with a "K," Kamel Red. That
11 particular type of -- or that particular cigarette is not
12 included in the buy-down offers.
13 Q. So that means except Red?
14 A. Yeah.
15 Q. And the rates are what, 30/\$3? How do I
16 interpret that?
17 A. 30 cents a pack, \$3 a carton.
18 Q. Thank you. And TBD, to be determined?
19 A. Yes, sir.
20 Q. Page -- I don't see the one that says 1999 VAP
21 promotions.
22 MR. KAMMER: What's the Bates stamp number?
23 THE WITNESS: I got it.
24 MR. MCGUIRE: 292.
25 MR. KAMMER: Okay.
26 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
27 Q. What does this -- how do I -- how do you
28 interpret this particular page?
111
1 A. This is a listing of the number of deals, if you
2 will, that are being reserved, if you will, in
3 anticipation of our stores ordering.
4 Q. So under promotions where they have Camels 99
5 cents/two packs --
6 A. Right.
7 Q. -- does that mean that they have especially
8 packaged two?
9 A. Correct.
10 Q. In a cellophane wrapped package where you buy it
11 for the price of one?
12 A. 99 cents less, right.
13 Q. And under "displays ordered," is that a special
14 display, different from things that are already existing
15 in the store?
16 A. Well, it displays -- really is not a display as
17 it is a prepack, if you will, containing perhaps 20 of
18 those. So a store orders where they get 20 of the
19 two-pack deals.
20 Q. And then they use that to display the item and
21 then sell you two separate packs if you buy it?
22 A. No. They actually are the packs themselves.
23 Q. So 4500?
24 A. Would be 4500 times -- in this case I believe
25 there were 20 to a display. So that would have been like

26 90,000 deals.
27 Q. Have you seen this display?
28 A. Yes, I did see it.

112

1 Q. Could you describe it on the record for us,
2 please.
3 A. A -- a carton -- that's not the right word for
4 it. I call it a flat. It's a -- it's a carrier,
5 probably the best closest thing, a carrier that contains
6 20 banded two-packs, the band says 99 cents off regular
7 price when purchasing two.
8 Q. And is this made so that it can be placed on the
9 counter?
10 A. It could be placed on the counter, yes.
11 Q. And where else could it be placed?
12 A. The displays in our stores, we take them out and
13 put them in baskets on the back bar.
14 Q. The back bar being?
15 A. Behind the counter.
16 Q. Okay. Did you sign this letter that's on page
17 293? I'm reading Bates numbers now.
18 A. Yes, I believe I did.
19 Q. Okay. The first sentence says that you intend
20 to move corporate stores participating in a Philip Morris
21 Exclusive Merchandising Program to a dual merchandising
22 program RJR/PM in calendar year 1999. What was the
23 nature of this exclusive merchandising program that
24 Philip Morris was involved in prior to your executing
25 this agreement?
26 A. We had tested the premise of having only the RDA
27 merchandising/merchandising agreement with Philip Morris
28 in approximately 160 stores, Kansas City market and Utah

113

1 market. During 1998 we discontinued that test early in
2 1999 and returned those stores to the program that was
3 then recommended for all the other stores, which was a
4 Philip Morris/R.J.R. program.
5 Q. Okay. And it talks about a survey process in
6 the second sentence. What does that mean or refer to?
7 A. Whenever there is an offer like this, we -- the
8 stores must order. We do not do force-outs to stores.
9 So we call it survey, and we send them an order form
10 recommending that they order them. We collect the orders
11 and turn them over to our wholesaler and notify the --
12 the manufacturer involved with the total quantity that
13 will be required.
14 Q. Okay. And let's go to 295. Doral Share of
15 Branded Savings Trend in C/G. What does that mean?
16 A. This is showing R.J. Reynolds, Doral, which is a
17 nonpremium brand, a savings brand if you will, how much
18 of that nonsavings business they were enjoying or they
19 had in the convenience/gas line channel of trade over
20 this time frame.
21 Q. And the percentages along the side. Is that a
22 percentage of sales?
23 A. It's a percentage of their sales within that
24 segment.
25 Q. Okay. Within the branded savings market?
26 A. Right. Correct.
27 Q. Which is the same as saying the nonpremium?
28 A. Yes. Well, there are -- there is another tier

114

1 below that, which is -- but -- I don't want to confuse

2 it. Yes.
3 Q. For practical purposes?
4 A. Yes. For practical purposes, yes.
5 Q. Winstons "No Bull" 1999, exciting news. Winston
6 will continue the "No Bull" 5 program during 1999. How
7 long was this program or has this program been in
8 existence?
9 A. I think this is the first I was aware of it.
10 Q. Do you know if 7-Eleven participated before 1999
11 in this program?
12 A. No, we did not.
13 Q. Do your stores currently have a "No Bull" ballot
14 box?
15 A. No.
16 Q. Did you reject participation in this program?
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. Why?
19 A. I just think I -- I call it a nonevent. It just
20 clutters up the counters, and I don't think really would
21 do anything for sales.
22 Q. Did Mr. Rumberger tell you that he thought that
23 this was a good program?
24 A. Sure.
25 Q. Is he the one that made this presentation to
26 you?
27 A. Yes.
28 Q. Okay. Let's go to 297. What do these numbers

115

1 reflect? Exactly what they say?
2 A. Yeah. They reflect the various manufacturers'
3 share of sales stated in cartons per week over this time
4 frame. Over the time frame shown.
5 Q. Cartons per week. So if I wanted to know the
6 total full price of cartons sold by 7-Eleven -- and,
7 again, is this corporate and franchise?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. -- for the month of February, I would take the
10 full price number at 144 and multiply by four?
11 A. Yeah, basically, yeah.
12 Q. Okay.
13 A. Now, these are purchases. Not necessarily
14 sales, but directionally they're close to sales.
15 Q. What's the difference? If apparently there's a
16 significant difference, you wouldn't have pointed it out
17 to me between a purchase and a sale.
18 A. I wanted to make sure these aren't stipulated as
19 being the exact sales figures. These are based on our
20 purchases.
21 Q. I see. You hope that there's eventually a
22 one-on-one relationship between purchase and sales,
23 right?
24 A. Yes. Over time there would be very close.
25 Q. But as of right now this shows what you bought?
26 A. Right.
27 Q. Hoping to sell?
28 A. Correct.

116

1 Q. And then we have under -- we have total full
2 price. And then you have brand savings?
3 A. Right.
4 Q. And then what's the next?
5 A. That is that third tier I referenced, saying
6 that there was a third tier, which is what you might call

7 black and white or generic, which we do very little
8 business in, as you can see.
9 Q. What's the difference between brand savings and
10 savings? The next one, I think, is savings, right?
11 A. Brand of savings would be a brand that has a
12 national brand recognition. And probably has some type
13 of advertising support from the manufacturers, as opposed
14 to a low-end priced cigarette with very little brand
15 recognition or support.
16 Q. BAT. Does that refer to Brown & Williamson?
17 A. Yeah. British American Tobacco, which is Brown
18 & Williamson.
19 Q. And then the last one I see is "Industry." How
20 does that relate to all the numbers that we saw above?
21 A. It's only selecting certain key brand out of
22 there and doing some comparisons.
23 Q. I see. It's the same thing with the listing
24 below -- maybe I'm not reading this right. Under where
25 it says R.J.R., 30.9, do you see that next to the --
26 yeah?
27 A. I'm sorry. R.J.R., 30. -- 30.9, yes. Okay.
28 Q. What does that reflect?

117

1 A. That is their share of --
2 Q. Total sales?
3 A. No. Of just in the savings brand area.
4 Q. Okay. So that would be branded --
5 A. No. I'm sorry.
6 Q. Go ahead.
7 A. That number is R.J.R.'s total cartons, out of
8 the total cartons here, both branded and premium.
9 Q. Okay. If I want to determine the total number
10 of cartons purchased by 7-Eleven corporate stores and
11 franchise stores in the country, I would add total full
12 price to total brand savings to total black and white or
13 generic?
14 A. You would look at -- that's done where the
15 industry figure -- industry line is. That is that number
16 there, 164.9.
17 Q. Okay. And then what is the separate 20.2?
18 That's not part of the total.
19 A. How much of that is in savings.
20 Q. I see.
21 A. Which is a combination of the 17.9 and 2.3.
22 Q. Okay.
23 A. Added to the total full price, which is 144.7.
24 Q. And then the last listing by industry is how it
25 breaks down by particular brand?
26 A. Certain brands within that, yes.
27 Q. All right. 304, just has this little -- the
28 last page, the "No Bull" Winston. Is there something on

118

1 this page?
2 A. You know, I'm sorry. I really don't know. I'll
3 have to go back and look. There had to be something
4 there.
5 (Whereupon, this ends the testimony deemed
6 confidential and subject to protective order entered by
7 the Superior Court of the County of Los Angeles, State of
8 California.)
9 ////
10 ////
11 ////

12 ////
13 ////
14 ////
15 ////
16 ////
17 ////
18 ////
19 ////
20 ////
21 ////
22 ////
23 ////
24 ////
25 ////
26 ////
27 ////
28 ////

119

1 ////
2 ////
3 ////
4 ////
5 ////
6 ////
7 ////
8 ////

9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

10 Q. Okay. Why don't you go to the next document.
11 We have the May 3 -- May 3, 2000 Swisher, or Bonfiglio to
12 Swisher at Reynolds, to Swisher. Is Swisher -- I think
13 you told me she works for R.J. Reynolds; is that correct?

14 A. Correct.

15 (Discussion off the record.)

16 (Exhibit 4054 was marked for identification.)

17 MR. KAMMER: 4054 for identification and I'm
18 marking Bates Numbers 305 through 322 is that what you
19 think 54 is?

20 MR. MCGUIRE: Yes.

21 MR. KAMMER: I'm not certain these are going to
22 be assembled correctly. So I'm going to ask you those
23 questions.

24 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

25 Q. What is this document?

26 A. This is a copy of a presentation that I did to,
27 as it says, to our division managers, division
28 merchandisers and market managers, field consultants. We
121

1 have a weekly video conference with these people. And it
2 was a presentation made to them, more or less, to provide
3 them the rationale for us selecting Dorals as our house
4 brand, if you will, which is a way of saying our -- the
5 brand that we're going to feature at less than premium
6 prices.

7 Q. What was the purpose of doing that?

8 A. In order for them to communicate to our stores
9 why we are taking this strategy, as well as to give them
10 information so they can support our recommendation to the
11 franchisees. So they will, in fact, follow our
12 recommendations, carry Dorals, et cetera.

13 Q. Why did you select Doral as the house brand?

14 A. A business decision based on the fact that it's
15 got brand equity. It's -- we're able to negotiate an
16 agreement with Reynolds that allows us to sell them at a

17 very attractive price in the marketplace. Compared to
18 other non brand -- nonpremium brands.
19 Q. Was that a strategy that's used in 1998?
20 A. No. No.
21 Q. When did you use it?
22 A. Began in July of '99.
23 Q. Is it still in effect?
24 A. Yes, it is.
25 Q. Has Doral always been the house brand?
26 A. No.
27 Q. -does the house brand change from time to time?
28 A. We actually have never had a house brand before

122

1 this.
2 Q. Okay. Is Doral still the house brand?
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. And is there any reason to expect that the house
5 brand will change in the -- by the next year?
6 A. Probably not.
7 Q. Okay. And who manufacturers Doral?
8 A. R.J. Reynolds.
9 Q. So R.J. Reynolds, have they paid anything above
10 and beyond what they normally would have paid in order to
11 be the house brand?
12 A. Just part of our total RDA agreement, one of the
13 elements of that agreement was that they would be the
14 house brand.
15 Q. I see. And did they pay for any marketing of
16 the concept that 7-Eleven would have a house brand and
17 you could get it for less? And it's a premium cigarette,
18 but we're selling it at less than premium prices, things
19 like that?
20 A. They're not paying us any funding to do that.
21 Q. Are they advertising or paying for advertising?
22 A. Specifically for 7-Eleven?
23 Q. Yes.
24 A. No. Other than they are doing some mailers on
25 the brand.
26 Q. The same type of mailers that you previously
27 described?
28 A. Yes.

123

1 Q. To their internal list of smokers?
2 A. Correct.
3 Q. And what was the goal here? To increase the --
4 well, what was the goal?
5 A. To increase our sales in nonpremium brands where
6 we were underdeveloped -- underdeveloped, based on
7 looking at total industry. We were selling less of this
8 product than the rest of the industry.
9 Q. Okay. And how did you know that by selling more
10 of it at a cheaper price would not adversely affect the
11 bottom line?
12 A. Well, that was our hypothesis. We didn't -- you
13 never do until you try it.
14 Q. So you figured that by lowering the price, we'll
15 sell more cigarettes and make up for the differential
16 between what we were selling Doral before we made it
17 house brand and after? And then continue to make more
18 profits, such that making the house brand would
19 ultimately, bottom line, end up leading to more profits
20 on the sale of these cigarettes?
21 A. I wouldn't state exactly that way. I would say

22 that --
23 Q. State it how you think is correct.
24 A. An opportunity for us to offer a product to a
25 customer that perhaps is not buying from us today because
26 we didn't have this type of value.
27 Q. And was this presentation that you made to your
28 employees and franchisees and managers one that you first
124
1 heard given to you by R.J. Reynolds?
2 A. Parts of it.
3 Q. Is this document something that you prepared
4 wholly for internal use and with your own assets, company
5 assets?
6 A. Not all of it. There are a couple of pages in
7 here which were from documents that they had provided to
8 me.
9 Q. Like which ones?
10 A. Page 7, page 9. That's it. Page 7 and 9 were
11 actually documented. They provided --
12 Q. Page 7 and 9?
13 A. -- pages 7 and 9.
14 Q. Okay. Is it your understanding and experience
15 that Doral, GPC and Basic are competitors?
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. Who manufactures GPC?
18 A. Brown & Williamson.
19 Q. Who manufactures Basic?
20 A. Philip Morris.
21 Q. Are all three of those brands considered premium
22 brands?
23 A. No.
24 Q. Are any of them?
25 A. No.
26 Q. What is brand equity?
27 A. I guess I would describe it as consumer
28 awareness of a brand and confidence in a brand.

125

1 Q. How do you know that Doral has brand equity?
2 A. Because of its current market share that enjoys
3 in the industry sales that it currently has.
4 Q. What does this mean, that "R.J. Reynolds has
5 national" -- on page 10 now. "R.J. Reynolds has national
6 support committed to Dorals." Did you explain what you
7 mean then by the three bullets that are below that?
8 A. Yes, sir.
9 Q. This national advertising in magazines with a
10 budget over \$7 million in 2000, do those include
11 magazines that are purchased primarily by minors?
12 A. No.
13 Q. How do you know that?
14 A. The magazines that I'm aware of that they're
15 advertising in are magazines, considered adult magazines.
16 Q. By whom?
17 A. By myself.
18 Q. Do you know that Philip Morris announced two
19 days ago that they were pulling their advertising from
20 magazines that had a readership, a minority readership of
21 15 percent or more?
22 A. No.
23 Q. Do you know that R.J. Reynolds said they weren't
24 going to do that?
25 A. No, I didn't.
26 Q. Can you call somebody in those two companies to

27 find out whether that's true?
28 A. Sure.

126

1 Q. Who would you call?
2 A. I'd probably call my national contacts.
3 Q. Who would that be?
4 A. Jamie French and Jean Swisher.
5 Q. Okay. If what I told you is true, would that
6 make any difference as to whether or not you used Doral
7 or not?
8 A. I don't know.
9 Q. Are you aware of a group in Washington, D.C., a
10 national organization called Smoke Free Kids?
11 A. No.
12 Q. Are you aware of a program or a study published
13 by Smoke Free Kids that indicates that the tobacco
14 industry has increased its advertising budgets in
15 magazines that go to primarily minority -- not minority,
16 minor readership?
17 A. No.
18 MS. TUCKER: Objection; lacks foundation.
19 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
20 Q. Next page, do you know one way or the other, as
21 to whether the fact that R.J. Reynolds packs their
22 cigarettes tighter to make them burn slower results in
23 more side-stream smoke per cigarette?
24 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for an expert
25 opinion outside the scope of this witness.
26 THE WITNESS: No.
27 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
28 Q. Do you know what side-stream smoke is?

127

1 A. No.
2 Q. It's the smoke that comes off the end of a
3 cigarette when you're not puffing it and is considered
4 very dangerous, more dangerous than mainstream smoke that
5 you blow out of your mouth. Having said that, do you
6 know whether or not the packing and slower burning of the
7 Doral cigarettes makes them more dangerous to
8 nonconsumers, bystanders, than other cigarettes that
9 don't burn as slow?
10 A. No.
11 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for an expert
12 opinion outside the scope.
13 MR. MCGUIRE:
14 Q. Have you ever inquired on that subject with R.J.
15 Reynolds to see if their cigarettes are any more
16 dangerous than their competitors as it relates to
17 environmental tobacco smoke?
18 A. No.
19 Q. What does pages 10 -- excuse me -- pages 11 and
20 12 represent?
21 A. These are pages from a publication that, once
22 again, is sent to smokers on R.J. Reynolds' mailing list.
23 Q. Have you seen the color version of this?
24 A. Yes, I have.
25 Q. Is it three color or more?
26 A. I'm not sure.
27 Q. Does every page of their brochure have a surgeon
28 general's warning on it?

128

1 A. I don't know.
2 Q. Do you know if it's supposed to?

3 A. No, I don't.
4 Q. Have you ever called 1-800-74-Doral to get more
5 information on Doral?
6 A. No.
7 Q. Do you know what Doral & Company is?
8 A. It's my understanding it's just basically Doral
9 smokers who are asked to be on the mailing list.
10 Q. For what purpose?
11 A. To receive information about special offers.
12 Q. When it says "To start getting even more from
13 Doral," what does that mean? Even more what?
14 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for speculation.
15 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
16 Q. Does it mean tar or nicotine, more disease, or
17 more something else?
18 A. I think it means getting more value.
19 Q. By value you mean either coupons or something
20 like that that would reduce the cost of the product, or
21 some other free thing that you would get that would be an
22 added benefit for the purchase of a cigarette, or neither
23 of those things?
24 A. Or as this one says, buy CD software for \$5.95,
25 which I'm not an expert, but I assume is a pretty good
26 price to pay.
27 Q. I can't read, and maybe my old eyes, that little
28 tiny thing that's underneath, join Doral & Company. It
129
1 says something about -- something phone calls restricted
2 to smoking?
3 MS. TUCKER: To smokers 21 years of age or
4 older.
5 MR. MCGUIRE: I'm sorry. Would you say it
6 again.
7 MS. TUCKER: What I read. I mean the witness
8 can read it, but the document speaks for itself, which
9 says "phone calls restricted to smokers 21 years of age
10 or older."
11 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
12 Q. Okay. We, this morning, talked about minors
13 being 18 years. Assuming that minors are 18 years or
14 younger, does your company sell cigarettes to people
15 between 18 and 21?
16 A. Assuming that 18 is the legal age, yes.
17 Q. And then the next page 315, Bate number, are
18 these other examples of this magazine that is sent to
19 Doral smokers?
20 A. Oh, I'm sorry. I've been looking at the wrong
21 page when you were talking to me. I was looking at that
22 other page.
23 Q. We finished that one.
24 A. Okay. This is the one we were just talking
25 about.
26 Q. No wonder that was hard to read. You were
27 trying to read the one "Doral Holiday Table"?
28 A. Yeah.
130
1 Q. Oh, wow. This is another reason why I should
2 put on the record why we get a laser copy of these
3 exhibits and/or an original if they're available. That
4 would be my first request, if not a color or laser print
5 of all of these things.
6 MR. KAMMER: Understood.
7 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

8 Q. Thank you. Do you know what the CD-Rom software
9 order form involves?
10 A. Other than what it says here, that's all I know.
11 That it's an offer that's being made by sending in pack
12 seals for Dorals.
13 Q. What is -- I'm now at page 14, Mr. Bonfiglio --
14 "SRP," standard retail price?
15 A. Suggested.
16 Q. Suggested retail price. "APSD"?
17 A. Average per store day.
18 Q. Gross profit, "GP."
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. And that was average per store?
21 A. Day.
22 Q. Day. Okay. What's a store day?
23 A. A single store's sales for the day. We take
24 that times the numbers of stores to get the total sales
25 for the day.
26 Q. Then you divide it by the number of stores to
27 get the average?
28 A. Yes.

131

1 Q. Okay. And what is the "LDU"? What does that
2 stand for?
3 A. Lowest distribution unit, which means the
4 minimum quantity that you could purchase.
5 Q. And "turns" are what?
6 A. An estimate based on estimated sales and the
7 quantity that you have to buy, how long it will take you
8 to sell through, and how many times a year that
9 merchandise, therefore, turns.
10 Q. Has 7-Eleven marketed the big box?
11 A. No. It's not -- it's shipping in July.
12 Q. And this is for Doral Lights, correct?
13 A. There's actually two versions. Lights and full
14 flavored.
15 Q. Is there a Doral Ultra Light, or is that someone
16 else's cigarette?
17 A. No. There is a Doral Ultra Light.
18 Q. And we talked about this this morning. So I
19 won't go back on it. I assume you don't know the
20 difference between light and ultra light?
21 A. No.
22 Q. And I wasn't trying to be insulting by that.
23 A. No.
24 MR. KAMMER: We ate lunch. We didn't talk about
25 that.
26 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
27 Q. I'm sure you didn't. I'm now on the next page
28 16, "For shipment the week of July 17th, SLIN, or survey

132

1 UIN." What is that?
2 A. SLIN is what's carry over from when we were
3 Southland, called Southland, S.L., item number. It's an
4 item number in our database.
5 Q. Okay. And the survey is --
6 A. It's a universal item number which is the
7 wholesaler's number for that item.
8 Q. Do you use several wholesalers or just the one
9 that's in Texas that we talked -- Mclane?
10 A. Mclanes is the wholesaler that all corporate
11 stores purchase from, is the recommended wholesaler for
12 all franchisees.

13 Q. Okay. And are they -- they're a wholesaler for
14 several tobacco companies?
15 A. Yes. They could basically carry them all.
16 Q. What about franchise stores, do they -- can they
17 use anybody they want for wholesale?
18 A. They can use other suppliers, yes.
19 Q. But it's recommended they use Mclane?
20 A. That's correct.
21 Q. Do they get benefit from using Mclane, do they
22 get the company's price?
23 A. Yes. We like to think there's a benefit, yes.
24 Q. And in volume there's usually a benefit?
25 A. Yes, and product selection. We just think they
26 provide the best service.
27 Q. Okay. What's the distribution of this magazine
28 that R.J. Reynolds sends out?

133

1 A. Oh, the numbers?
2 Q. Yeah.
3 A. I don't know.
4 Q. No one's ever told you when you have a
5 readership?
6 A. Yes. Somewhere along the line someone's told
7 me, but I couldn't quote it right offhand. I don't know.
8 Q. Do you have any idea? Are we talking about
9 hundreds of thousands or are we talking about thousands?
10 A. I don't know.
11 Q. On page 320 where they had the authorized
12 temporary sign, do the manufacturers have to have your
13 approval for temporary signs?
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. On franchise stores as well as company stores?
16 A. No, for corporate stores. Yes, for franchise
17 stores. We recommend that these are the only signs.
18 Q. Do you recommend that your franchisees contact
19 you in the event that their requested by the cigarette
20 manufacturers to display something that hasn't come
21 through the recommended channels?
22 A. No.
23 Q. Is this an example of what might be a dangler?
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. I can't make out 18. But it's basically an
26 example of how they'll identify Doral as your lowest
27 price saving brand?
28 A. That's correct.

134

1 Q. And is this a POP element that is recommended by
2 the company to the franchise stores?
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. Is this a POP element that I would find in
5 stores here in San Diego?
6 A. I would hope so.
7 Q. Page 19 is cut off on the left-hand side?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. But I think I could make out who we're talking
10 about. This breaks down where your stores are located?
11 A. That's correct.
12 Q. And what does the ordering number mean, ordering
13 column? Excuse me.
14 A. That's the number of stores that ordered the
15 last recommended promotion.
16 Q. What's wrong with the northeast? They just
17 don't get the word, or are they all independent or what?

18 A. They are -- that is a franchise division. And
19 they buy a lot from wholesalers that we have a difficult
20 time tracking information from, for one thing.

21 Q. Have you ever found that the franchise stores
22 were able to cut a better deal than you were able to do
23 on behalf of the corporate stores?

24 A. Once in a while.
25 (Exhibit 4055 was marked for identification.)

26 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

27 Q. The next document for identification is, we will
28 marked as 4055. It's dated August 5th, 1998. It has do
135

1 with this case and it's to Beverly Lopez from Arthur J.
2 Stevens.

3 MR. KAMMER: They probably need one.

4 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

5 Q. There's one right there. Have you ever seen
6 this before?

7 A. No, sir.

8 Q. Is Ms. Lopez in-house counsel?

9 A. Yes, sir.

10 Q. Do you know what "indemnify" means?

11 A. My interpretation would be hold harmless.

12 Q. Do you know if Lorillard selected the counsel
13 that are defending you in this case?

14 A. No, I don't.
15 (Exhibit 4056 was marked for identification.)

16 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

17 Q. Okay. 4056 for identification is a Key
18 Findings. Can you identify this document as to who
19 prepared it?

20 MR. KAMMER: Is this Bates 323 through 326?

21 MR. MCGUIRE: Yes, sir.

22 THE WITNESS: This is information -- the
23 documents were provided to me by R.J. Reynolds.

24 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

25 Q. When?

26 A. Well, sometime in 1997. They're dated 12-17-97.
27 I don't recall exactly when.

28 Q. When they tell you that one of the disadvantages
136

1 of Doral is that it has less strength compared to GPC,
2 what do you understand that to mean?

3 A. I'll be honest with you, I'm not sure what that
4 means.

5 Q. Well, what do you think it means?

6 A. I think it means it doesn't taste as strong.

7 MS. TUCKER: Belated objection. Calls for
8 speculation.

9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

10 Q. How is that different than less long lasting
11 aftertaste, less artificial taste, less papery taste? If
12 they meant taste, wouldn't they use that?

13 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for speculation,
14 lacks foundation.

15 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

16 Q. We are a Supreme Court works. It meant that
17 they would have said that, I think.

18 A. I'm not sure.

19 Q. And the faster burn rate, is that a disadvantage
20 or an advantage to a nonsmoker entering the same room as
21 the smoker?

22 A. To a nonsmoker, I wouldn't know.

23 Q. Does this document represent facts to you?
24 A. Facts to me?
25 Q. Yeah. You look at this and say these are facts
26 that I can rely on.
27 A. No. I think this is probably, directionally,
28 some information based on some market research.

137

1 (Exhibit 4057 was marked for
2 identification.)
3 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
4 Q. Let's go to the next one. 4057. 327 to 341.
5 And you may want to take your position here, Bill. But
6 save you. What does C/G National mean?
7 A. Convenience/gasoline national numbers.
8 Q. So that would be -- is it everybody, including
9 7-Eleven or --
10 A. We would be included in those numbers, yes.
11 Q. Who is your chief competitor?
12 A. Depends on the market area.
13 Q. California?
14 A. Probably AM/PM.
15 MS. TUCKER: I'm going to jump in here because I
16 wasn't really given a chance to jump in. I'm assuming
17 this document is -- we haven't established this, but is
18 something that is from a marketing meeting between
19 7-Eleven.
20 THE WITNESS: That's correct.
21 MS. TUCKER: And one of the tobacco
22 manufacturers. So I would request if that, in fact, is
23 what this is, that this document and any testimony
24 regarding it be marked confidential pursuant to the
25 protective order.
26 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
27 Q. Let's find out whether it is or not. What is
28 this document?

138

1 A. This was a document that was presented at a
2 meeting in Winston-Salem with myself and two other
3 members of our merchandising department, my boss and his
4 boss.
5 Q. And what company was presenting this?
6 A. R.J. Reynolds.
7 Q. And what individual or individuals were
8 representing R.J. Reynolds?
9 A. Brian Stockdale, whose title, I believe, is
10 National Sales and Marketing for R.J. Reynolds. And then
11 I will tell you that we had the Camel brand managers.
12 And I would have to go back and look at my -- see if I
13 could find the names. I'm not -- I couldn't give you the
14 names specifically.
15 Q. As I read this graph, it would indicate that
16 Southland or 7-Eleven sells more cigarettes than all
17 other competitors combined.
18 A. No.
19 Q. Okay. Help me on this because it looks to me
20 like, for example, in October '98, that C/G National sold
21 six.
22 A. That's a share.
23 Q. Oh, they had a six?
24 A. Camels and C/G were 6 percent of the total
25 sales, whereas in 7-Eleven stores they were 6-1/2 percent
26 of total sales.
27 Q. Okay. There we go. So this is the share of

1 A. That's correct.
 2 Q. What are the well-known equities of Camels?
 3 A. I don't know. Well-known equities? Just a
 4 brand name. Consumer awareness of the brand name.
 5 Q. How does that differ from the strong brand
 6 profile?
 7 A. I don't think it does.
 8 Q. Does the presenter have different things to say
 9 about these two bullets and just can't remember how he
 10 differentiated them?
 11 A. He probably differentiated them. To my mind,
 12 there's not much differentiation.
 13 Q. And he also has growing acceptability. What was
 14 that about? What was his point there? More people are
 15 smoking Camels?
 16 A. I think he's saying that Camels are gathering a
 17 bigger share of the business.
 18 Q. Are these Camel Filters and Camel Regular or
 19 Full Camels?
 20 A. All Camels. I think that was -- I'm sorry, what
 21 was the question? Maybe I answered it wrong.
 22 Q. Whether this growing acceptability -- what these
 23 factors driving Camel's performance related to the entire
 24 brand filters and nonfilters?
 25 A. Yes.
 26 Q. What was the "create talk value"? What was that
 27 all about?
 28 A. I couldn't tell you.

1 Q. Did he tell you how they were planning to grow
 2 the volume and share and to recapture the brand's
 3 momentum?
 4 A. There was discussion about their advertising
 5 campaigns for Camels.
 6 Q. Was there a discussion about Joe Camel --
 7 A. No.
 8 Q. -- and his demise?
 9 A. No.
 10 Q. Was there actually no discussion about that?
 11 A. No.
 12 Q. Okay. There was no discussion. And I said --
 13 was there absolutely no discussion?
 14 A. Absolutely no discussion about Joe Camel. No,
 15 I'm sorry.
 16 Q. I guess what I was looking for was a "yes" to my
 17 negative answer.
 18 A. Okay.
 19 Q. I understand you now. You didn't talk about Joe
 20 Camel at all?
 21 A. Absolutely not.
 22 Q. Did you talk about Joe Camel's successor?
 23 A. No.
 24 Q. Did you talk about their advertising program,
 25 what they were going to be doing, what it would look
 26 like?
 27 A. Yes.
 28 Q. Whether they would use cartoons again, whether

1 they'd use people you can't tell how old they are?
 2 MS. TUCKER: Objection; compound. Will you let
 3 the witness answer the question.

4 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
5 Q. For example?
6 A. None of those topics were discussed.
7 Q. What did they discuss, if anything, about their
8 advertising program?
9 A. What they would be doing in advertising, which,
10 you know, featuring Turkish tobacco, one thing is a
11 product attribute. They showed us mock-ups of magazine
12 advertising that was planned.
13 Q. Okay. And did they give you -- I don't know if
14 it's in here. Did they give you something to take with
15 you at those mock-ups?
16 A. I don't believe so. I think that was just --
17 they brought in boards and showed them. I don't think we
18 had anything that we took back with us, no.
19 Q. And you have no idea what create talk value
20 refers to?
21 A. No.
22 Q. Who has to have competitive level and coverage
23 of promotion? I'm now on the next page.
24 A. R.J. Reynolds would like to have the ability to
25 have participation in their activities.
26 Q. Is that what coverage of promotion means?
27 A. Yeah.
28 Q. Okay. And when they wanted to get greater

142

1 differentiation, what does that mean?
2 MS. TUCKER: Objection.
3 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
4 Q. As far as you understand.
5 A. As I understand it?
6 Q. Yeah. Based on what they told you.
7 A. To make Camels more of a top of mind intent to
8 purchase item than another brand.
9 Q. What type of image were they going to create or
10 were they presenting to the purchaser?
11 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for speculation.
12 Lacks foundation.
13 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
14 Q. Just want to know what they told you, not
15 necessarily what the truth was.
16 A. To a certain extent it was a retro kind of
17 campaign.
18 Q. What did you understand that to mean, or what
19 did they tell you it meant?
20 A. That's hard to explain. If you could imagine a
21 cigarette girl but with a cell phone. Kind of a retro,
22 but yet relevant, is the way I think they described it.
23 Q. I don't know what a cigarette girl looks like, I
24 guess. What do you see -- what do you mean by a
25 cigarette girl?
26 A. A nightclub with a tray of cigarettes.
27 Q. I see.
28 A. But with a cell phone. So it was more relevant

143

1 to today.
2 Q. I see. Did they tell you why that they thought
3 this retro idea was going to help them become top of mind
4 and grow their product?
5 A. Not because their ad agency -- no, I mean, in
6 fact, Camel has a lot -- have brand equity. It goes back
7 a long ways and I guess reaching back.
8 Q. 1913.

9 A. Is that what it was?
10 Q. That's just part of their retro advertising,
11 isn't it?
12 A. I don't recall that particular part of it.
13 Q. Fine blend of Turkish and domestic tobaccos.
14 How much poster boards did they show you?
15 A. I think three.
16 Q. Did one involve a '50s/60s teenager, big
17 pompadour, combing his hair with a pack --
18 A. No.
19 Q. -- of Camels?
20 A. No. No.
21 Q. Did one involve a guy with a fedora hat on and a
22 rain coat, looked like Humphrey Bogart? Although these
23 were all cartoons?
24 A. No, no cartoons.
25 Q. These were actual pictures that you say?
26 A. I guess drawings might be a better word.
27 Q. Isn't that what they actually used, drawings?
28 Isn't that actually what they're using now in this retro
144

1 program?
2 A. I believe so, yeah.
3 Q. And same kind of cartoonish thing as Joe Camel?
4 A. No.
5 Q. Are they people instead of animals?
6 A. No.
7 Q. What was your reaction to the retro advertising
8 program when they presented it to you?
9 A. None of this stuff, really --
10 Q. Impacted?
11 A. I'm more interested in what they're doing, in
12 terms of value added, and what they're going to offer,
13 value as opposed to advertising.
14 Q. Were there going to be any changes in the
15 product?
16 A. They have a new product or a new blend if you
17 want.
18 Q. What's that?
19 A. Turkish Gold.
20 Q. Okay. Did they talk anything about marketing a
21 safer cigarette to you?
22 A. No.
23 Q. Not during this program, but have they told you
24 anything about their new safe cigarette?
25 A. I know a little bit about Eclipse.
26 Q. Are your stores going to carry it?
27 A. No.
28 Q. Why not?

145
1 A. It's not available to retail, as far as I know.
2 Q. Well, if it were available, you're not in any of
3 their test market areas?
4 A. No.
5 Q. Have you asked about it?
6 A. I've asked about it, yeah. And they just said,
7 you know, they're just not ready to move forward with it.
8 Q. Did they say why?
9 A. No.
10 Q. How did you know about Eclipse?
11 A. I think first time is because, I think, my
12 Reynolds rep smokes them.
13 Q. And what about packaging changes, during this

14 presentation for the Year 2000, what type of packaging
15 changes were there going to be?
16 MS. TUCKER: Objection.
17 THE WITNESS: I don't recall any.
18 MS. TUCKER: Calls for speculation, lacks
19 foundation.
20 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
21 Q. You don't remember him talking about any
22 packaging changes?
23 A. It may not -- I'm not sure what meeting, because
24 I know they have one or two brands that they're going to
25 make available in hard packs that weren't before. I'm
26 not sure if that was discussed at this meeting or not.
27 Q. Did they speak about having tins?
28 A. Yes. Yes, that's right. Yes, they did talk

146

1 about having tins.
2 Q. And what about the experience, what were they
3 telling you their -- or what was the substance of the --
4 A. I don't think there is any substance to it.
5 That's my opinion.
6 Q. Well, I know that your opinion may be different
7 than theirs, but what do you remember them telling you,
8 if anything?
9 A. I don't remember them telling me anything.
10 Q. Okay. So this now gets into some of the details
11 of the differentiate the image type thing. Simple,
12 posterised format. Fun and irreverent Camel personality.
13 Tell me about that. What's that about?
14 MS. TUCKER: Objection; lacks foundation, calls
15 for speculation.
16 THE WITNESS: I'm not sure what that means. The
17 only thing I picked up out of this was the combination.
18 Like I said, kind of a recalling the Camel Heritage, if
19 you will. But adding in a currentcy to it with cell
20 phones and that. I think there were several other type
21 things like that.
22 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
23 Q. Did they tell you that Camel smokers are
24 irreverent and therefore likely to heed warnings?
25 A. No.
26 Q. At least that's what they were looking for was
27 irreverent customers?
28 MS. TUCKER: Objection; nonsensical question.

147

1 Are you asking him did they tell him that?
2 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
3 Q. Yeah. Yeah. Did they come out and tell you
4 that they were looking for -- or who they were looking to
5 market were smokers who would not heed warnings appearing
6 on the package?
7 A. No.
8 Q. Or anywhere else? No?
9 A. No.
10 Q. And what does it mean that something -- the new
11 campaign is flexible and allows for maximum integration?
12 What do you understand that means?
13 A. I don't have any understanding of what that
14 means.
15 Q. And how were they going to leverage
16 authenticity?
17 A. I don't know.
18 Q. What's this gentleman's name again that gave you

19 this presentation?
20 A. I think it was the Camel brand manager.
21 Q. And you told me his name before?
22 A. Well, no, I didn't. Brian Stockdale is not the
23 Camel brand manager. He is, I believe, their national
24 sales -- national sales manager. I don't remember the
25 Camel brand manager. As a matter of fact, I think it's a
26 lady, come to think of it.
27 Q. Is she from New York, the lady?
28 A. No.

148

1 Q. Is she from Winston-Salem?
2 A. Yes, sir.
3 Q. What's the SFX arenas?
4 MS. TUCKER: What page are you on?
5 MR. MCGUIRE: 337.
6 THE WITNESS: 337?
7 MR. MCGUIRE: Yeah.
8 THE WITNESS: I don't know.
9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
10 Q. And what is New Camel Cash?
11 A. New Camel Cash is a save UPC codes and you get
12 certain things. It's, I guess, a customer loyalty
13 program between the customer and Reynolds.
14 Q. If you save -- what did you say?
15 A. I think they save the UPC codes off the packs.
16 Q. Okay. Send them in for --
17 A. Yeah. Something out of a catalogue, yeah.
18 Q. Like green stamps used to be --
19 A. Yeah, I guess so.
20 Q. -- direct mail? What were they telling you
21 about their ability -- it's the same thing. We have a
22 list of smokers, and we direct mail things periodically,
23 including our magazine, et cetera?
24 A. I don't think the magazine -- I think the
25 magazine goes through Doral, I believe.
26 Q. Do you know if R.J. Reynolds has a magazine
27 that's focused on all of their brands?
28 A. I don't know that.

149

1 Q. SOM, next page. The objective is to increase
2 Camel SOM?
3 A. Share of market.
4 Q. Share of market. Was it advantageous for you to
5 have them test some of these packaging or promotional
6 ideas in 7-Eleven first?
7 A. I believe so.
8 Q. And have you agreed to jointly develop
9 promotions that leverage 7-Eleven's equity in programs?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. What's involved in those programs?
12 A. Well, we tested the Camel Keg.
13 THE REPORTER: I'm sorry?
14 THE WITNESS: K-e-j.
15 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
16 Q. K-e-g?
17 A. K-e-g.
18 Q. Anything else?
19 A. No.
20 Q. Anything else that you are scheduled to test
21 market?
22 A. Yes, a Doral five-pack.
23 Q. And if they were willing to provide you with the

24 cigarettes, would you test market the Eclipse?
25 A. I don't know.
26 Q. Have you asked about the Accord?
27 A. No, I have not.
28 Q. Do you know what that is?

150

1 A. I do know what it is.
2 Q. Okay. Are there any other tobacco manufacturers
3 that are manufacturing or test marketing currently
4 cigarettes that are claimed to be safer?
5 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for speculation.
6 THE WITNESS: I don't have -- I don't know of
7 any of them making that claim, and I don't know of any
8 others.
9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
10 Q. You don't know of anybody making that claim?
11 A. I'm not aware of that claim being made.
12 Q. When they told you about Eclipse, they didn't
13 tell you it was a safer cigarette?
14 A. No.
15 Q. What did they tell you it was?
16 A. Produces less smoke.
17 Q. You just reduced -- you just deduced that it
18 meant a safer cigarette from less smoke?
19 A. No, I didn't deduce it. No.
20 Q. Do you think, as you sit here now, that if a
21 cigarette has less smoke, it will be safer?
22 MS. TUCKER: Object. Are you done with your
23 question?
24 MR. MCGUIRE: Yeah.
25 MS. TUCKER: Okay. I'm just going to state
26 generally that I've had a problem throughout this
27 deposition where the witness and the questioner seem to
28 be running over each other. To be candid, I don't know

151

1 why the court reporter hasn't said anything before. So I
2 apologize that I keep interrupting, but there's been a
3 lot of people running over each other. So I'm just going
4 to state -- set that out there. So hopefully from this
5 point out, to have a clear record, everyone can wait a
6 minute.
7 But my objection is that that question is
8 outside the scope of this witness's both area of
9 expertise and what he's here to testify about today, and
10 calls for an expert opinion. And we probably need to
11 have the question reread because of my long statement
12 there. I apologize.
13 MR. MCGUIRE: I think he answered it before you
14 interrupted.
15 MS. TUCKER: So I don't know if the witness
16 needs the question reread, or did he answer the question?
17 MR. MCGUIRE: I thought he did.
18 MS. TUCKER: I apologize. I didn't hear that.
19 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
20 Q. Let's go to 340. Camel Cash Trip Sweepstakes.
21 Is this something that you're going to run in your
22 stores? And by your stores, I mean either one.
23 A. No.
24 Q. Did you advise them at the time that you didn't
25 want to run sweepstakes, or this particular one at least?
26 A. Yes, I did.
27 Q. Did they tell you why they thought running
28 sweepstakes was a good idea?

1 A. They probably did, but I couldn't remember
2 exactly what it was.

3 Q. Are you an ally of R.J. Reynolds tobacco company
4 in the sale of cigarettes?

5 A. Can you define "ally."

6 Q. Yes. Someone who you create an alliance with.

7 MS. TUCKER: Objection; vague, lacks foundation,
8 calls for speculation.

9 THE WITNESS: I don't know how to answer that
10 question. Do we have a merchandising agreement with them
11 as we do with two other companies? So to that extent,
12 yes.

13 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

14 Q. Okay. Do they call it an alliance?

15 A. I think they call all of their programs with all
16 of their retailers an alliance, if I recall. If I
17 remember correctly. Like --

18 Q. All their retailers are their allies?

19 MS. TUCKER: Objection; misstates the witness's
20 testimony.

21 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

22 Q. Are you in partnership with Philip Morris in the
23 sale of cigarettes?

24 MR. KAMMER: Objection; calls for a legal
25 conclusion.

26 THE WITNESS: We formerly were a signatory to a
27 merchandising or an RDA agreement called retail masters
28 and now retail leaders. So I would say no.

1 (Exhibit 4058 was marked for identification.)

2 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

3 Q. Okay. 4058 for identification is a document
4 dated February 3, 2000, 7-Eleven and Philip Morris
5 Partnering for Success. What is this?

6 A. This was a presentation that was made to --
7 actually it was not. I did not participate, I don't
8 think, in this particular meeting. It was with vice
9 president of non-food merchandising. And senior vice
10 president of merchandising at the time would have been
11 David Podeschi who was the vice president non-foods. And
12 Gary Rose, senior vice president of merchandising.

13 MS. TUCKER: I'll just say, for clarity, that we
14 ask to continue to have this portion of the depo marked
15 confidential in reference to this next exhibit, and
16 discussion regarding this exhibit as well.

17 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

18 Q. If you turn to Bates 348, there is a scale
19 that's marked "Dif versus YAG." What does that stand
20 for?

21 A. Difference versus year ago.

22 Q. And if you go to the next page, it says
23 "Industry Volume Comparison" in billions of units. What
24 units, packs?

25 MS. TUCKER: Objection; it's my understanding
26 this witness wasn't even at the meeting where this
27 document was discussed.

28 MR. MCGUIRE: I know, thank you. Your objection

1 is noted.

2 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

3 Q. Now, please answer the question.

4 A. I believe they talk about single cigarettes when

5 they talk about units, I believe.
6 Q. So this would indicate that as of September 1998
7 they had sold -- the industry had sold -- or is this just
8 7-Eleven had sold 7.3 billion cigarettes?
9 A. Right.
10 Q. And the following year as of the same time they
11 sold 7.1 billion cigarettes?
12 A. That's correct. I believe that's what they
13 represent.
14 MS. TUCKER: So I don't keep needing to
15 interrupt any questions regarding this document, I'll
16 object to as calling for speculation and lacking
17 foundation as to this witness.
18 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
19 Q. Have you received a similar presentation at
20 other times regarding similar representations on volume
21 of cigarettes sold?
22 A. Yes. Similar.
23 Q. Okay. Is that what you're relying on to answer
24 my questions, as to what units were being referred to in
25 this particular chart?
26 A. Yes.
27 Q. Okay. And if we turn to the next page, this is
28 in millions of cartons. Is there 20 packs to a carton?

155

1 A. Ten.
2 Q. Ten packs to a carton, and 20 cigarettes to a
3 pack?
4 A. Correct.
5 Q. And this is volume of 7-Eleven sales by various
6 manufacturers in 1999, and then comparing to what it was
7 in '98; is that right?
8 A. That's correct.
9 Q. I don't know if it's in any one of these
10 documents someplace, but do you know what share of the
11 cigarette sales market 7-Eleven has?
12 A. No, I don't.
13 Q. Whether you sell 10 percent or 80 percent?
14 A. No, don't know.
15 Q. If you go to 353 at the bottom, there is a
16 source that says "PM Stars Chain Aggregate Database."
17 What do you understand that means?
18 A. This is shipment information from wholesalers
19 reported to Philip Morris.
20 Q. And this Stars Chain Aggregate, that's the
21 database -- or the data collection source that Philip
22 Morris uses?
23 A. I believe it's their -- yeah, their database.
24 Q. Okay. Next page source is "MSA Shipments 6mm
25 ending September 1999." What do you understand that to
26 mean?
27 A. I'm not entirely sure. MSA means metropolitan
28 statistical area. But I have to look at this more

156

1 closely to understand what it means.
2 Q. And if you go to the next page, the source of
3 that is PM Chain Aggregate. How is that different from
4 the PM Stars Chain Aggregate, if you know?
5 A. I don't know that it is different.
6 Q. If we go to 360, this apparently is a chart
7 involving promotional spending. How do you read that?
8 A. This is Philip Morris's representation of the
9 amount of money they have put against their brands in our

10 company through buy-down funding or others, other
11 methods.
12 Q. Would that include advertising or would it just
13 be --
14 A. No.
15 Q. -- promotional?
16 A. Just promotional.
17 Q. So as I read this, they have put \$17.8 million
18 into buy-downs for Marlboros?
19 MS. TUCKER: Objection; the document speaks for
20 itself.
21 THE WITNESS: Yes.
22 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
23 Q. And does the next column over indicate that the
24 next year they put in 20 million?
25 MS. TUCKER: Same objection.
26 THE WITNESS: Yes.
27 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
28 Q. Okay. And in 1999 does that mean they're going
157
1 to put in 71 million?
2 MS. TUCKER: Same objection.
3 THE WITNESS: Yes.
4 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
5 Q. And in the year 2000 they're going to put in 85
6 million?
7 MS. TUCKER: Same.
8 THE WITNESS: That's their --
9 MS. TUCKER: Calls for speculation.
10 THE WITNESS: That is their estimate.
11 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
12 Q. Okay. And when we get for the year 2000
13 potential, are they also going to now -- instead of just
14 promoting Marlboro, they're going to promote Basic as
15 well?
16 A. Correct.
17 Q. What's OPB, OPB stand for?
18 A. Other premium brands.
19 Q. That's what I thought. So in the year 2000 they
20 are representing that they will spend \$85 million on
21 advertising Philip Morris products -- not advertising,
22 promoting Philip Morris products, and 92 million
23 promoting other premium brands?
24 A. No. No.
25 Q. What does that mean then with those two numbers
26 together?
27 A. We, at this point in time, were on retail
28 leaders program Level A. And at Level A, that is the
158
1 amount of funding that would be provided for buy-downs,
2 if you will. They wanted us to go to a higher level,
3 basically almost an exclusive. And then there would be
4 more funding for Marlboros.
5 Q. I see. Let's turn to the next page. CPW, what
6 does that stand for?
7 A. Cartons per week.
8 Q. And let's go to the five P's on the last page,
9 363. Philip Morris is stating here that they can grow
10 the average carton sold per week from 190 to 250 at
11 7-Eleven by position, product promotion, presence and
12 people. I know you weren't part of this particular
13 presentation, but do you know from other experience with
14 Philip Morris as to what these mean or meant at the time

15 that the representation was made?
16 A. In a general sense, yes.
17 Q. Just give me what your understanding is.
18 A. Position would be the positioning of the
19 products within a display.
20 Q. Okay. Product is self-explanatory.
21 A. Product is having the correct product.
22 Promotion is participating in the buy-downs and the
23 value-added offers, et cetera.
24 Q. Okay.
25 A. Presence is POP signage.
26 Q. Okay.
27 A. And I'm not exactly sure with people, other than
28 just everybody kind of working together.

159

1 (Discussion off the record.)
2 (Exhibit 4059 was marked for identification.)
3 MR. MCGUIRE: Exhibit 4059 is entitled "Trade
4 Council," and it's Thursday, April 2nd, 1998.
5 MS. TUCKER: We'll keep my spiel here. We'll go
6 with our same continuing designation of this as
7 confidential because it appears that it was a
8 presentation by Philip Morris on the bottom right-hand
9 corner designation.
10 MR. KAMMER: You realize I'm going to search --
11 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
12 Q. What is this document?
13 A. This is a document that was given to me after
14 Gary Rose attended a Philip Morris trade council
15 retailers meeting in New York.
16 Q. What was the subject matter of the meeting, as
17 you understand it?
18 A. They have the agenda business updates and what's
19 going on in -- in the industry.
20 Q. Does Philip Morris have these meetings annually,
21 or more frequently than that?
22 A. They were doing them twice a year.
23 Q. And Mr. Rose, does he routinely attend them?
24 A. He had routinely attended them prior to that,
25 and it was Dennis Potts who was vice president for
26 merchandising, would attend.
27 Q. Have you ever attended any?
28 A. No.

160

1 Q. And is this document given to all attendees?
2 A. I believe it is.
3 Q. Is this document given to all retailers that
4 attend?
5 A. I believe so.
6 Q. Is a confidentiality agreement signed by
7 everyone that attend indicating that they will preserve
8 this document, keep it confidential, not disclose it to
9 anybody?
10 A. I don't know.
11 Q. Did Mr. Rose tell you, when he gave you this
12 document, that you had to put it in a room without a fax
13 machine, a telephone or any other means of communication,
14 keep it confidential?
15 A. No.
16 Q. Do you know what the source of all this, I guess
17 the sources are indicated in the bottom of each view
18 graph; is that correct?
19 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for speculation.

20 The document speaks for itself other than that.
21 THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I didn't hear an
22 answer. Did you answer?
23 THE WITNESS: I believe the source is what's
24 listed on here, to the best of my knowledge.
25 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
26 Q. If you go to page 385, Box Smoker Share By Age.
27 What is the share that's the highest? What age group is
28 that?

161

1 MS. TUCKER: Objection; lacks foundation, calls
2 for speculation and the document speaks for itself.
3 THE WITNESS: To be honest with you, I can't.
4 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
5 Q. I can't read it, let alone hear it. Do you know
6 what that is? I can't see anything before -- I know 24
7 is the last number. But I can't make out whatever it is
8 before that.
9 MS. TUCKER: Counsel, it's entirely
10 inappropriate to have this witness try to read a document
11 for you because maybe the Xerox cannot come off well,
12 given that he's already testified that he wasn't even at
13 the meeting when this document was presented. So that's
14 the basis for my objection.
15 MR. MCGUIRE: You can just object. Nobody cares
16 right here what the basis of it is. If I do, I'll ask
17 you. Just make the objection. And I'm particularly not
18 interested what you think is appropriate or not.
19 MS. TUCKER: All right, Counsel. Well, there's
20 really no need for the rude tone in your voice. I wasn't
21 trying to be rude.
22 MR. MCGUIRE: Well, I wasn't either. Just
23 direct.
24 MS. TUCKER: Let me just clarify, and this will
25 take one minute while you're looking through the
26 document. The reason I explained the basis for my
27 objection was, rather than to keep stating my objections
28 over and over, perhaps the questions would be a little

162

1 more eloquently phrased.
2 MR. MCGUIRE: Thank you for your --
3 MS. TUCKER: But I'll just state the objections
4 from now on.
5 MR. MCGUIRE: Sorry for being ineloquent.
6 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
7 Q. What are C-stores?
8 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for speculation,
9 lacks foundation.
10 THE WITNESS: Convenience stores is generally
11 what they're referred to.
12 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
13 Q. In this graph do you know whether or not
14 Southland or 7-Eleven is included within the C-store?
15 A. I'm sorry. What graph are we on, sir?
16 Q. For example, 388.
17 A. I can only assume so, yeah. Let me retract
18 that. I'm sorry. The source is AC Nielsen. So I'm not
19 sure that we would be represented in there because, to
20 the best of my knowledge, we do not provide information
21 to AC Nielsen.
22 Q. If you go to page 393, do you know what Philip
23 Morris Tracking refers to under the source?
24 A. No.

25 (Exhibit 4060 was marked for identification.)
26 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
27 Q. Exhibit 4060 for identification is a similar
28 document, only this one is dated 1999.

163

1 Do you know what this document is?
2 MS. TUCKER: Again, I'll continually request
3 that we have this portion marked confidential as to this
4 exhibit.
5 THE WITNESS: It is a similar deck of material
6 that, I believe, was provided to Gary Rose at another
7 trade council meeting.
8 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
9 Q. Did Mr. Rose provide this copy to you?
10 A. Yeah, I believe so.
11 Q. Did you review it at or about the time you had
12 it?
13 A. Yes, briefly.
14 Q. Did you have any questions about what it meant?
15 A. Not really.
16 Q. Did you know what it meant?
17 A. In general.
18 Q. On what basis did you know what it meant?
19 A. My ability to read and comprehend.
20 MS. LONG: Can you all speak up, please.
21 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
22 Q. Did it include your experience in the business?
23 A. That's probably an element of it, yes, sir.
24 Q. Regular brand OOS.
25 MS. LONG: What page are you on?
26 MR. MCGUIRE: 424.
27 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
28 Q. What does OOS stand for?

164

1 A. Commonly referred to out of stock.
2 Q. Was Philip Morris -- is it your interpretation
3 of what one of the messages was in the presentation that
4 you shouldn't be out of stock? You should stock enough
5 of the brands that your customers want?
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Going to 402. Talk about Marlboro average net
8 pack prices. Do you know what accounts for the price
9 increase between July of 1998 and January of 1999, almost
10 50 percent -- well, 50 cents a pack?
11 A. July of '98 to -- cost increase.
12 Q. Is this cost increase to you that you passed on
13 to the buyer?
14 A. That's correct.
15 Q. Do you know what -- do you have any idea if
16 there was a cost increase to the manufacturer that they
17 passed on to you?
18 A. No.
19 Q. Was there any type of tobacco blight, or
20 something like that, that would have affected the cost of
21 tobacco leaves?
22 A. No, not that I'm aware of.
23 Q. Does this represent the average retail price
24 across the country?
25 A. I believe that's what it's purported to
26 represent, yes, sir.
27 Q. Do you know if this price increase would -- it
28 says "net pack prices." Does that mean it's the price

165

1 before retail, or are these reflected in retail prices?
2 A. These are reflected in retail prices.
3 Q. In California there was Proposition 99 or
4 Proposition 10, maybe. It was what added a 50 cent per
5 pack tax on. Do you know if that is included in here?
6 A. Yes, I forgot that. Yes, that would be part of
7 the impact, yes.
8 Q. Do you know if other states have done the same
9 thing?
10 A. There have been state excise taxes in some
11 states, yes.
12 Q. Does the purchaser pay that 50-cent tax?
13 A. The end purchaser?
14 Q. Yeah.
15 A. In effect, yes.
16 MS. TUCKER: Objection, belatedly, too.
17 Incomplete hypothetical and vague.
18 (Exhibit 4061 was marked for identification.)
19 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
20 Q. Let's go to the next document. 4061 for
21 identification. "Building business at 7-Eleven," January
22 7, 2000. Is this a 7-Eleven-generated document?
23 A. No, sir.
24 Q. Who generated this document?
25 A. Philip Morris.
26 Q. Okay.
27 MR. MCGUIRE: I assume we're going to have
28 Philip Morris generating this document.

166

1 MS. TUCKER: I know. I heard. I was just
2 looking very quickly at the document. Well, I'll just
3 move things along. I haven't had a chance to look at the
4 document, but I'm assuming it's a kind of marketing plan.
5 So we'll, of course, mark this portion and this exhibit
6 as confidential.
7 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
8 Q. How did you come in possession of this document?
9 A. This one, to the best of my recognition --
10 recollection, was a meeting between myself and Jamie
11 French where he made this presentation.
12 Q. Did he make the presentation at or about the
13 time the document's dated?
14 A. I believe so.
15 Q. And what was the purpose, as you understood it,
16 of the presentation?
17 A. More or less a business review, current
18 situation analysis.
19 Q. What was the goal as you understood it?
20 A. Generally to employ what would be considered
21 best practices in terms of carrying brands that are in
22 demand to point out some possible pricing opportunities
23 that we might have, request some consideration for
24 perhaps some point of purchase material.
25 Q. In other words, he wanted you to consider some
26 point of purchase material?
27 A. Yes.
28 Q. Some point of purchase material that would

167

1 promote Philip Morris?
2 A. Correct.
3 Q. Turn to page 348.
4 MR. KAMMER: 348?
5 MR. MCGUIRE: I'm sorry, 438.

6 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
7 Q. What does this tell you?
8 A. This is a discussion about what is seen as some
9 difficulties in getting new item introductions into our
10 stores, as timely as Philip Morris feels they should be.
11 Q. Okay. And one of them was inconsistent ordering
12 practice; is that right?
13 A. Correct.
14 Q. What does that mean?
15 A. They don't feel our stores do a real good job of
16 ordering.
17 Q. And apparently you didn't use all the Marlboro
18 cartons you could have used in the buy one, get one free
19 promotion; is that an example?
20 A. That's correct.
21 Q. And you just told me what OSS was and I forgot.
22 A. Out of stock.
23 Q. "Out of stock during new brand launches and
24 price promotions." Now, did he have a solution to these
25 practices in order to help solve these problems?
26 A. He had some suggestions.
27 Q. Okay. And what's the NPI?
28 A. NPI is our new -- is actually new product

168

1 information system or process where we notify stores of
2 new items, give them the ordering information, and ask
3 them to place orders.
4 Q. Now he wanted it to be done from a central
5 source, rather than to go to your stores?
6 A. He wanted 7-Eleven to basically do automatic
7 distributions.
8 Q. And he wanted that to happen in your franchise
9 stores, as well as your corporate stores?
10 A. Yes, ultimately.
11 Q. And did you tell him that you couldn't do it for
12 the franchise stores, that they have to agree with what
13 you decide might be good; you can only suggest, not
14 compel?
15 A. Well, I did more than that. I just told him
16 basically it's not our approach to do distribution even
17 to corporate stores. The store manager is responsible
18 for it.
19 Q. What is the FOA?
20 A. Franchise owners association.
21 Q. Next page, what is the Marlboro exterior
22 core-plas, c-o-r-e - p-l-a-s sign look like?
23 A. What page are we on?
24 Q. 439.
25 A. What does it look like? It's a sign, these are
26 approximate dimensions. I believe 2 feet wide by 3 feet
27 high. That it would be mounted to a pole or some other
28 way on the exterior of the store, or someplace on the

169

1 store parking lot.
2 Q. Okay. Turn to the next page 440, and what does
3 EDLP stand for?
4 A. Every day low price.
5 Q. What were the next steps that he discussed with
6 you as indicated on 441?
7 A. The implementation of some of his
8 recommendations.
9 Q. Anything else?
10 A. No.

11 Q. Did you agree to implement any of the
12 recommendations?
13 A. No. We agreed to test using outdoor signage in
14 Florida. And this is a typo. It wasn't 2000, June 2000,
15 this month to see if, in fact, it created additional
16 sales over what we normally get. We are going to test a
17 Marlboro five-pack offer in one market area.
18 Q. Now, other than R.J. Reynolds and Philip Morris,
19 has anyone else made similar type presentations to you or
20 to Mr. Rose or someone else who came back to you and
21 said, "Here's what they're suggesting we do in
22 merchandising and promoting and marketing cigarettes in
23 our stores or our franchise stores"?
24 A. No. We have had some -- some meetings with
25 Brown & Williamson along similar lines, but no.
26 Q. Have they created a document like any of these?
27 A. I don't think so. No.
28 Q. We talked about the fact that you went back to
170
1 Winston-Salem and had Reynolds make a presentation to you
2 about their new brands and their image and their
3 marketing and their advertising, et cetera. Has Brown &
4 Williamson done a similar type presentation?
5 A. No.
6 Q. Has Philip Morris done a similar type of
7 presentation?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. Is what they've done not -- I didn't see what a
10 similar type presentation were in these materials. Do
11 you think there is one in this stack here someplace?
12 A. Not exactly the same method, no.
13 Q. Anything similar?
14 A. I guess this one would be.
15 Q. Give me the Bate numbers.
16 A. I'm sorry.
17 Q. That's all right.
18 MR. KAMMER: 466.
19 MR. MCGUIRE: Okay. So we'll take it a little
20 bit out of order. 466 to 505 we'll mark as Exhibit 4062.
21 (Exhibit 4062 was marked for identification).
22 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
23 Q. And, again, I know it's probably self-evident,
24 but just to keep the record straight, what is this
25 document?
26 A. I guess you would call it a business -- one
27 against a business review. And, actually, this is the
28 introduction of a new retail leaders program that was
171
1 being made available by Philip Morris.
2 MS. TUCKER: Counsel, can I just clarify, I
3 couldn't tell. Was the witness indicating this document
4 was created by Philip Morris?
5 THE WITNESS: Yes.
6 MS. TUCKER: So, then again, we'll mark this
7 portion of the exhibit as confidential.
8 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
9 Q. How did you come in contact with this document.
10 A. This was presented to me. I believe I was the
11 only one that it was presented to at that time by Jamie
12 French.
13 Q. Was it presented at or about the date of the
14 document, December of '99?
15 A. Yes, sir.

16 Q. What did he tell you was going on in the
17 marketplace, as best you can recall?

18 A. That sales in the industry there was still a
19 decline. That Philip Morris was outperforming the
20 industry, I believe. That C-store sales were not
21 declining at the same rate that they were in some other
22 channels of trade. And that this new -- some of the new
23 elements in one of the retail leaders program was
24 something that would probably be advantageous to
25 consider.

26 Q. What is the category approach?

27 MS. LONG: What page are you on?

28 MR. MCGUIRE: Same page. Number 2.

172

1 THE WITNESS: In broad terms it just means
2 looking at the entire category, all brands, looking, I
3 guess, where the bang is managing the category. Category
4 management, if you will.

5 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

6 Q. Page 4, there's RL and NRL. What do they stand
7 for? Lower right-hand corner.

8 A. Boy. I'm sorry. I don't -- I don't recall.

9 Q. And is the cartons per week column in millions,
10 millions of cartons per week?

11 A. No. That's actually cartons per week. Average
12 per store cartons per week.

13 Q. Okay. So 128 Philip Morris cartons per store
14 per week sold in the United States?

15 A. I may have to come back -- I'm sorry. Now, do I
16 recall what this means?

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. This is a comparison showing how stores who are
19 on a retail leaders program with Philip Morris outperform
20 stores that are not on a retail leaders program.

21 Q. Okay. And then am I right this is -- are you
22 correct that this is 219 cartons per week?

23 A. Per week.

24 Q. Per store?

25 A. Per store. But that's not -- I'm sorry. I
26 think you asked me before if that was what nationally the
27 number would be.

28 Q. Yeah.

173

1 A. And it wouldn't. It would be a combination of
2 the two, depending how many stores were on a program and
3 how many weren't. Somewhere between those two numbers.

4 Q. Did Mr. French explain to you -- I'm referring
5 now to page 7 -- what the purpose of the legislative
6 information hotline was, last bullet?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And what was his explanation?

9 A. A way for someone to phone in the discovery of
10 gray market cigarettes in a retailer.

11 Q. Would you explain what that term means.

12 A. Gray market is cigarettes that are manufactured
13 for export that somehow find their way back into the
14 United States.

15 Q. When they're manufactured for export, are they
16 manufactured in the same way, as far as you know, as
17 cigarettes sold here?

18 MS. TUCKER: Objection; calls for --

19 MR. MCGUIRE: For consumption.

20 MS. TUCKER: I'm sorry. Objection; calls for

21 speculation.
22 THE WITNESS: I have been told that sometimes
23 the formulation is somewhat different.
24 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
25 Q. Who told you that?
26 A. Probably -- I can't -- I couldn't -- I'm not
27 sure I could positively identify the person. But I
28 believe I've been told that by many people within all 174
1 three major cigarette companies I deal with there are
2 some different taste, if you will, to some of their
3 products shipped to other countries based on preference
4 there.
5 Q. Is there a tax avoidance as well with gray
6 market cigarettes?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. And gray market cigarettes are something that
9 the manufacturer wants to avoid?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. As you understood it?
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. And the government wants to avoid?
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. And the retailer wants to avoid?
16 A. Legitimate retailers.
17 Q. Okay. Would the retailer profit by selling gray
18 market cigarettes somehow?
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. Because he could save the tax money?
21 A. Correct.
22 Q. Okay. By saving the tax money, I mean the tax
23 money, instead of going to the government, would go in
24 his pocket or per pocket?
25 A. Correct.
26 Q. Let's go to page 8, new plans. What does that
27 first bullet refer to, those various initials?
28 A. These are -- boy, these are just their, I guess, 175
1 acronyms for their different levels of retail masters --
2 retail leaders, which, since then have been changed to
3 ABCDEF, if I recall right.
4 Q. Okay. And what is CPL?
5 A. That was -- that was -- I couldn't tell you what
6 CPL was, but there were four levels of retail leaders.
7 There was a CL, a PM, a KS, and a WH. Those were levels
8 that you could opt to participate in.
9 Q. All right. Let's go to the next bullet.
10 "Enhancements and Clarifications," "Step Up
11 Merchandising" means what to you?
12 A. I don't think we discussed that.
13 Q. Does that have a meaning to you?
14 A. No.
15 Q. Okay. "Signage Clarifications," by that, does
16 that mean they were clarifying the types of signs that
17 could be used per their written agreement, prior written
18 agreement?
19 A. More clarifying what types of signs other
20 manufacturers would -- you could have from other
21 manufacturers, if you were on their program.
22 Q. Okay. In other words, eliminating problems with
23 having other manufacturers' cigarettes in your stores?
24 A. No. The original leaders program had some
25 restrictions on the amount of signage from other

26 manufacturers that could be present. And it was not --
27 it was -- it was fairly restrictive and not very clear in
28 its definition. The new program is a little less
176

1 restrictive, or less restrictive, and it's more clearly
2 defined.

3 Q. What are channel strips?

4 A. Channel strips are long, thin strips that go
5 into a molding on the front of a shelf.

6 Q. They serve what purpose?

7 A. Brand identification, price callout.

8 Q. I see. They're strips that have some sign or
9 something on them?

10 A. That's right.

11 Q. If you go to page 12, is it your understanding
12 that the CPL's referred to there are levels of
13 participation that you could opt to be involved with?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. What does it mean, Court Ordered Permanent
16 Signage Modifications, at CPL2?

17 A. When Philip Morris introduced their original
18 retail leaders program, I believe, R.J. Reynolds,
19 Lorillard and Brown & Williamson eventually all joined
20 together in trying to, I guess, sue Philip Morris for
21 restriction of trade, I believe. That their contract
22 requirements were somehow not -- I'm not -- once again,
23 that's where I get -- somehow not legitimate. And I
24 guess they got a court injunction against some of the
25 signage restrictions that were in there.

26 Q. And the bullet that says "The objective of Youth
27 Smoking Prevention." And that's all caps, is Youth
28 Smoking Prevention a program that Philip Morris was
177

1 sponsoring?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And what's its objective, if you know?

4 A. Make sure that cigarettes are not sold to anyone
5 not of legal age, and to educate the consumer.

6 Q. How does this program work? Is something done
7 by Philip Morris, or is something done by you, or the
8 both of you together?

9 A. There's a requirement that you either use
10 certain age-restricted POP's, come of age POP, or you
11 have a program of your own. But you always have the POP
12 posted talking about the need to verify age, et cetera.

13 Q. Next page. "Improved line of sight definition"
14 supposed to improve youth access prevention. How does
15 that work?

16 A. I think it's just more clearly defined how the
17 merchandise needed to be displayed behind the counter.

18 Q. Are your present agreements in 2000 with Philip
19 Morris governed by this share calculation methodology
20 that's outlined on page 14?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And on the various levels described on page 15?

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. If you go to page 16, what does the "PM provided
25 fixtures" refer to?

26 A. It spells out if you're on a program with Philip
27 Morris, and if you elect to use fixturing they provide,
28 what fixturing they will provide. Basically, it says
178

1 they will provide fixturing for their products.

2 Q. What does that mean, fixtures?
3 A. Display fixtures behind the counter, shelving,
4 et cetera.
5 Q. Has Philip Morris provided you with a contract
6 that you told them you cannot comply with because it
7 doesn't make any sense, because you don't get their
8 displays and fixtures, you have your own shelving and
9 things like that?
10 A. No. We were able to work that out.
11 Q. These pages that go on from 489 that show
12 shelving and signage, are these shelves, back-bar-type
13 shelves that you use in your stores?
14 A. No.
15 Q. Is this just an exemplar of what you could do if
16 you use their fixtures?
17 A. Correct.
18 Q. There's different types of -- keeps going for
19 several pages. Are any of these fixtures that are used
20 in any of your stores, corporate or franchise?
21 A. I'm sorry. I'll have to give you a rather long
22 answer to that. We have about 200 stores where we have
23 Philip Morris fixtures currently that were installed back
24 in 1998, similar to these. All the rest of our stores we
25 installed our own fixtures, which in some ways are
26 similar. We intend to replace the Philip Morris fixtures
27 sometime this year with our own.
28 Q. Okay. If you go to page 19. "Added Flexibility
179
1 For Retailers, Optional Enhanced Header." A header again
2 is a sign that advertises a product; is that right?
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. When they say it "Communicates the category to
5 the adult smokers," what does "category" mean in that
6 context?
7 A. My take away from that is it communicates the
8 cigarette category.
9 Q. Okay. And what's the brand message of various
10 cigarettes?
11 A. Marlboros, Camels.
12 Q. What's the message that that brand provides?
13 MS. LONG: Object; speculation.
14 MS. TUCKER: Lacks foundation.
15 THE WITNESS: I guess that's just that you have
16 Marlboros or Camels.
17 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
18 Q. What's the Reserved Growth Fund? I'm referring
19 now on page 24.
20 A. Reserve Growth Fund is funding to support
21 buy-down activity that is over and above the standard
22 number of weeks in an agreement.
23 MR. MCGUIRE: Okay. Is everybody making it
24 okay? Anybody want a break, or should we continue to try
25 to get this thing done? We haven't put much of a dent in
26 a lot of papers here.
27 MR. KAMMER: I'm sure Tom is.
28 THE WITNESS: I'm okay.
180
1 MR. MCGUIRE: I'm trying my best. It is a lot
2 to cover. Anyway, if anybody, including you, want to
3 have a break, and I'm not saying that this will help, but
4 just please, just tell me. It's not meant to be a
5 marathon.
6 (Exhibit 4063 was marked for identification.)

7 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
8 Q. Okay. 4063, May 10, 2000 memorandum. Did you
9 prepare this?
10 A. I shared in the preparation of this with our
11 legal department.
12 Q. Was this memorandum sent to all of the stores,
13 including the franchise stores?
14 A. It was sent to our division managers, with
15 request that it be provided to all stores, yes, and
16 franchisees.
17 Q. What's a Plan-O-Gram?
18 A. A schematic, an outline of placement of product.
19 Q. If you turn to the last page, the last, second
20 to last paragraph, does that mean that all of the stores
21 make \$10 -- almost \$10,000 a year just by virtue of
22 participating in the RDA programs?
23 A. That's correct.
24 Q. Do they make any money on top of that in terms
25 of -- is the goal, hopefully, that he will also make
26 additional profits on top of that because of
27 participating in the RDA program?
28 A. In terms of sales, yes.

181

1 (Exhibit 4064 was marked for identification.)
2 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
3 Q. Yeah. 4064, May 1, 2000, can you identify this
4 sir.
5 A. Yes. This is a letter that I sent out to my
6 division merchandisers who are responsible for the
7 cigarette category in each division.
8 (Exhibit 4065 was marked for identification.)
9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
10 Q. Okay. What is 4065?
11 MR. KAMMER: Don't forget, I can't number them
12 at this point until you tell me what you're looking at.
13 MR. MCGUIRE: 446 through 454.
14 THE WITNESS: This is the actual retail leaders
15 program agreement.
16 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
17 Q. Did you sign this?
18 A. This was signed by Gary Rose, Vice President,
19 Senior Vice President of Merchandising.
20 Q. You recognize his signature?
21 A. Yes, I do.
22 Q. Is the document complete, as best you can --
23 best you know?
24 A. I think there are two front pages here. I think
25 these are duplicates.
26 Q. Other than the two front pages, which makes it
27 more than complete, is there anything that is obvious to
28 you or apparent to you that has been left off of this

182

1 document?
2 A. I don't believe so.
3 Q. If you go to the last page, Exhibit C, under
4 volume, is that cartons per week per store or just
5 cartons per week?
6 A. Cartons per week per store.
7 (Exhibit 4066 was marked for identification.)
8 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
9 Q. 4066, 455 through 458. Could you describe what
10 this document is.
11 A. Yes. This was a summary of my recommendations

12 about participating in a different level of the Philip
13 Morris RDA agreement, which they sent to the vice
14 president of non-foods merchandising and senior vice
15 president of merchandising.
16 MR. MCGUIRE: What's the last Bate number there,
17 Bill?
18 MR. KAMMER: What do you mean by last?
19 MR. MCGUIRE: The last one we did.
20 MR. KAMMER: 458.
21 MR. MCGUIRE: 458?
22 MR. KAMMER: I mean the -- when you say the last
23 one --
24 MR. MCGUIRE: I'm sorry. 4066 is the -- what's
25 the last Bate number of that?
26 MR. KAMMER: 458 -- 455 through 458.
27 MS. TUCKER: So I think this is the next
28 document.

183

1 MR. KAMMER: The next in order says 1999 Retail
2 Leaders -- we're missing a bunch of numbers because
3 that's the one you took out premature.
4 MR. MCGUIRE: What we'll mark for identification
5 as 4067, entitled 1999 Retail Leaders Growth Fund
6 Changes.
7 (Exhibit 4067 was marked for identification).
8 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
9 Q. Are you familiar with this document?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. What is it?
12 A. It was a modification made to the 1999 leaders
13 program by Philip Morris, where at certain levels there
14 was increased amount of funding available for buy-downs.
15 Q. Okay. 4068 for identification is Bate numbered
16 506 through 541.
17 (Exhibit 4068 was marked for identification).
18 MS. LONG: Excuse me. Is 4067 a Philip Morris
19 document?
20 MR. KAMMER: Yes.
21 MS. TUCKER: I'm sorry. I thought you were
22 going to ask another question about it. Then I'm losing
23 my numbers. 4067.
24 MR. KAMMER: 4067.
25 MS. TUCKER: Thank you. Should be marked
26 confidential as well as this exhibit. And I think 4068
27 probably -- is that the next one you were going to go to?
28 MR. MCGUIRE: Southland retailers.

184

1 MS. TUCKER: Right. Because it looks like the
2 same type, I'm assuming it's also --
3 MR. MCGUIRE: 4068 is dated October 21, 1998.
4 So, you know, looks like every one of these documents has
5 already been marked confidential for whatever reason. So
6 if the documents themselves are already marked, it's the
7 testimony that I guess you want to make sure. And since
8 I'm going to be talking about documents, and to make life
9 easier for everybody, I will give you a continuing
10 objection or instruction that the transcript be prepared
11 as you want it, so long as these documents are
12 confidential.
13 MS. TUCKER: That's fine, except for some of the
14 documents are 7-Eleven documents. That's why I haven't
15 been indicating it for everything. So I know I was
16 trying to think of a way to make it easier.

17 MR. MCGUIRE: All right.
18 MR. KAMMER: If it's not too interruptive, I
19 asked her to use her voice as her documents come up
20 because when we get the transcript, I can search on her
21 name.
22 MR. MCGUIRE: I see.
23 MR. KAMMER: And I'm actually doing it for all
24 the documents.
25 THE REPORTER: Can we go off the record so I can
26 clarify something?
27 MR. MCGUIRE: Sure.
28 (Discussion off the record.)

185

1 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
2 Q. Okay. What is 4068 for identification?
3 A. A business review from Philip Morris presented
4 to me.
5 Q. By whom?
6 A. Jamie French.
7 (Exhibit 4069 was marked for identification.)
8 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
9 Q. What's Exhibit 4069 for identification, which
10 I'll describe as being a letter to Philip Morris --
11 excuse me -- a letter apparently to Philip Morris.
12 A. I'm sorry. We're on a different one.
13 MR. KAMMER: Have you -- excuse me. Have you
14 skipped Bates 542? Yeah. Do you want to take this in
15 order?
16 MR. MCGUIRE: Sure. Sure. We'll make this
17 4069.
18 THE WITNESS: Actually, I think that's part of
19 the prior documents.
20 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
21 Q. Do you believe that this is part of a prior
22 exhibit that had to do with the Doral house brand
23 strategy?
24 A. Yes.
25 MR. KAMMER: Which was marked 4054 for
26 identification.
27 THE WITNESS: The first two pages are. And I
28 think the balance of them may be. Well, I'm sorry, it's

186

1 a combination of part of that document and then some
2 material from R.J. Reynolds. First two pages definitely
3 go to that prior document. The third page is the number
4 of stores participating in the R.J.R. -- RDA agreement,
5 currently, that I prepared. 545 through 549 is material
6 that was presented at the same time the Camel
7 presentation was done in Winston-Salem that we reviewed
8 already.
9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
10 Q. 547 to 549?
11 A. 545 to 549.
12 (Exhibit 4070 was marked for identification.)
13 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
14 Q. Okay. What's Exhibit 4070 for identification,
15 which is Bates 506 to 541? This is the one that I first
16 marked 4069 -- excuse me -- 4068.
17 A. 4068.
18 Q. Did we already do this one?
19 MR. KAMMER: Yes. That was the Philip Morris
20 Business Review dated 10-21-98.
21 MR. MCGUIRE: All right. What was it that I --

22 MR. KAMMER: You've already pulled --
23 MR. MCGUIRE: Okay. We've got 4069. Here we
24 are. 4070 is 550.
25 MR. KAMMER: And 551.
26 MR. MCGUIRE: Right.
27 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
28 Q. And what is that, sir?

187

1 A. When we signed the retail leaders program back
2 effective July 1st of 1999, there were some
3 clarifications to the standard agreement that I wanted
4 Philip Morris to confirm.
5 MR. MCGUIRE: And let's go to 4071. Bates 552
6 to 587.
7 (Exhibit 4071 was marked for identification.)
8 THE WITNESS: This was an information package
9 that was sent out for distribution to -- I believe this
10 is the franchise version -- yes -- to all our franchisees
11 explaining the three new recommended RDA programs with
12 Philip Morris, Reynolds, and Brown & Williamson. And
13 asking them to provide us with confirmation that they
14 were going to participate in them. In asking them to
15 review, make a decision whether to participate or not,
16 and if so, to sign the participation forms.
17 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
18 Q. Who prepared this package?
19 A. Most of this is my work. The participation
20 forms would have been done by our legal department.
21 Q. Some handwritten notes on page 567 that I cannot
22 read. Can you read them or can you tell, at least,
23 whether that's your handwriting or printing? It's a more
24 legible note on 568, the next page over.
25 A. It --
26 Q. Try the next page. You can see "product
27 availability."
28 MS. LONG: What page are you on?

188

1 MR. MCGUIRE: 568.
2 MR. KAMMER: 568.
3 THE WITNESS: I believe I sent this to a
4 franchisee who had some questions about what his
5 obligations were with the Brown & Williamson program,
6 regarding if he had to participate in promotions, if he
7 had to have certain space, and if he had to have certain
8 products available. And I believe I sent them to them,
9 probably with a note saying, "See the items I marked for
10 clarification." If you look at the first page of the
11 document, you can see a handwritten note where this
12 indicates to me this is a copy of something I used to
13 send to a franchisee to -- based on his request for
14 information.
15 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
16 Q. So the writing on 467 and 468, is this
17 franchisees -- as well as 469?
18 A. No. These were my kind of pointing out to him.
19 These are the areas he was asking for information on,
20 specifically.
21 Q. I can't read them, but I'm assuming we're going
22 to get a more legible copy eventually. And your printing
23 looks like it's readable so far. If you go to 4 --
24 excuse me -- 572, there is a handwritten note on the
25 margin on the left side. Is that in your --
26 A. Yes, it is.

27 Q. -- printing?
28 A. Yeah.

189

1 Q. Do you know what that says?
2 A. Yeah. "To be used without center panel."
3 Q. And why was that?
4 A. Because of the height. This was when we first
5 went into the program, we were still installing back
6 bars. So in many stores we did not have the back bars
7 yet. We agreed to use counter displays until the back
8 bars were completed. But I did not agree to use this
9 display unless they reduced the height of it, and they
10 could do that by taking out the center section.
11 Q. In the photograph of the display itself, or in
12 the image of the display itself, first it says "New Kool
13 Natural." What's natural about this, if you know?
14 A. That's their brand. It's called Kool Natural.
15 I believe they use natural menthols is what it is.
16 Q. And this Carlton 1 mg, what does that stand for?
17 MS. LONG: Objection; calls for speculation.
18 THE WITNESS: I think it's got something to do
19 with nicotine or something.
20 THE REPORTER: I'm sorry?
21 THE WITNESS: I think it has to do with
22 something with tar or nicotine content.
23 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
24 Q. And can you read on your copy the handwritten
25 notes on 573?
26 A. Yes. These were sku's, s-k-u apostrophe "s."
27 Q. If you can't, that's okay. I just want to know
28 if you could.

190

1 A. That was part of the original recommended
2 product assortment. I'm sorry, I would not be able to
3 completely --
4 (Exhibit 4072 was marked for identification.)
5 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
6 Q. Okay. 4072 for identification is a document
7 Bates 588 through 614 to Jamie French from you. Is that
8 your signature?
9 A. Yes, sir.
10 Q. Document's dated August 18, 1999. What does it
11 generally relate to?
12 A. It's -- dis-- any time you have Philip Morris,
13 do any kind of fixture installation in your store, or
14 like, for example, repair an overhead pack merchandise,
15 or anything like that, they require you to sign this
16 document.
17 And I ran this by my legal department. And
18 basically they drafted this response, that the two
19 purposes of the agreement is to protect Philip Morris
20 against liability in connection with the installation of
21 cigarette displays performed by parties other than Philip
22 Morris contractors.
23 So if we at any point were using any kind of
24 fixturing, and like I said, in some stores we had, was
25 holding them harmless if they didn't do the installation
26 themselves.
27 Q. Philip Morris required you to sign this
28 agreement even though you thought it was confusing and

191

1 inapplicable?
2 A. Yes.

3 (Exhibit 4073 was marked for identification.)
4 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
5 Q. Let's go to 4073, which is on Philip Morris
6 letterhead. It is dated October 1998. And would you
7 advise us or inform us as to what this is.
8 A. Yes. These are the provisions under which
9 Philip Morris will provide funding, some funding for
10 fixtures installed by the retailer of their choice, and
11 at their expense.
12 Q. Is this included with any of the other prior
13 agreements we've already marked?
14 A. I do not believe so, no.
15 MS. TUCKER: I will request that any testimony
16 about this document be marked confidential.
17 (Exhibit 4074 was marked for identification.)
18 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
19 Q. Let's go to 4074 for identification, which is
20 630 through 635. Who prepared this?
21 A. I did.
22 Q. What was the source of your information?
23 A. This is kind of a matrix outlining the various
24 cigarette RDA programs that were available. Both the
25 current one that was in effect, and ones that had been
26 proposed. The differences in and my recommendations to
27 the company as to which ones we should go to.
28 Q. And the documents that are attached to this
192
1 first matrix?
2 A. I'm sorry. I did not prepare those, no. That
3 is from Philip Morris.
4 Q. This is dated January 14, 1999; is that right,
5 upper first page?
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Upper left-hand corner?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. And how does this other information that is
10 attached to the first document relate to the matrix
11 itself, if it does?
12 A. It relates to it in the fact that up until that
13 time we had not received an official notification from
14 Philip Morris that the current agreement we were under
15 was going to expire on a particular date.
16 Q. So was this meant to -- meant to reflect the
17 prearrangement, as opposed to the proposed 1999
18 arrangement, which you've summarized on the first page?
19 A. This was to represent where we were, what was on
20 the table, and the fact that a decision needed to be made
21 because our current agreement was going to expire.
22 Q. When was the agreement going to expire?
23 A. March 31st, 1999.
24 Q. Okay. And the handwritten notes that are on the
25 first page, are they yours?
26 A. Yes.
27 Q. Rather than struggling through this, and on
28 reliance that we'll get a cleaner copy, and that we'll
193
1 pass on any further dwelling. The next two pages are not
2 table -- together, but they seem to be similar, so I'm
3 going to mark them as one. Exhibit 636 and 637 will be
4 marked for identification as 4075.
5 (Exhibit 4075 was marked for identification).
6 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
7 Q. And if you tell me what kind of documents these

8 are, or can you identify them?
9 A. Yes. These are -- these documents were provided
10 to tell us what franchisees will be paid from Philip
11 Morris, if they elected not to go with our recommendation
12 for category level, which is 1. If the franchisees opted
13 for Level 2, they would be paid \$318. If they opted for
14 Level 3, they would be paid \$377. So if, in fact,
15 franchisees did opt for that, we would have a record on
16 file.
17 MS. LONG: This is a Philip Morris document?
18 THE WITNESS: Yes, these are Philip Morris
19 documents.
20 MS. LONG: Any testimony related to these
21 documents should be marked confidential.
22 (Recess taken.)
23 (Exhibit 4076 was marked for identification.)
24 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
25 Q. Mr. Bonfiglio, what is Exhibit 4076 for
26 identification, which is dated May 15, 2000?
27 A. It's a copy of the letter we reviewed before
28 that was signed by Gary Rose, asking that the letter
194
1 itself be distributed to our franchisees and to our store
2 managers about the new agreement.
3 Q. As well as a copy of the new agreement?
4 A. As well as a copy of the new agreement, yeah.
5 Q. Okay. I'm going to go out of order here.
6 MR. KAMMER: No problem. You mean page order?
7 MR. MCGUIRE: Yeah. 753.
8 MR. KAMMER: Is this going to be Exhibit 4077?
9 (Exhibit 4077 was marked for identification.)
10 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
11 Q. What is Exhibit 4077? It looks like a
12 daily/weekly planner. But whose is it and whose
13 handwriting is it?
14 MR. KAMMER: How big is this exhibit?
15 MR. MCGUIRE: One page.
16 MR. KAMMER: 753?
17 MR. MCGUIRE: Yes.
18 THE WITNESS: Well, I'm not sure whose daily
19 planner it's from. This goes back to when there was an
20 increase in excise tax on cigars in California 7-1 of
21 last year, I believe. And we were trying to determine
22 whether or not we were obligated to pay the tax on floor
23 stock. And I think the whole -- my wholesaler, Mclanes,
24 finally came back and said they had researched it and
25 there was no floor stock inventory that had to be taken
26 or taxed.
27 (Exhibit 4078 was marked for identification)
28 ////
195
1 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
2 Q. 755 through 759 is dated 6-11-99. It's on
3 Mclane Southern California fax cover sheet.
4 Can you tell me what that document is.
5 A. That's related to the prior one. And this was
6 providing me with the new costs. Additional tax added to
7 them would be so that we could update our database.
8 MR. MCGUIRE: Okay. That was Exhibit 4078, if I
9 didn't designate it on the record. 4079 on the record is
10 Bate numbers 760 through 772 on Mclane Pacific Grocery
11 Distribution letterhead.
12 (Exhibit 4079 was marked for identification).

13 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

14 Q. Can you tell me what this document is.

15 A. I think it's -- it's the same information from
16 Mclane Pacific that was on the prior sheet, which was
17 from Mclane Southwest. We have two Mclane centers
18 servicing California stores. So they each provided me a
19 listing of the new tobacco products with the higher taxes
20 included on them.

21 Q. I see cigars. Are cigarettes any part of this
22 document?

23 A. That tax at that time was only an increase on
24 other -- what's called other tobacco products, smokeless
25 cigars, et cetera.

26 Q. Do you have Prince Albert in a can? That was a
27 joke.

28 A. Let him out.

196

1 Q. You guys are too young because that's an old --
2 that was an old joke. Okay. While we're running into
3 things that really don't make a hill of beans to me,
4 what's 773 through 774, is that the same subject matter?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. We're not even going to mark that. 775 through
7 776?

8 MS. LONG: Hold on a second.

9 MR. KAMMER: Yeah, I can help you, but only so
10 far. Don't do that to me.

11 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

12 Q. Hold on a second. I'm going a different way
13 now. Does 775 to 778 relate to the same subject matter?

14 A. Yes, it does.

15 Q. What about 779 through 787?

16 A. No. It's a different matter. Not 100 percent
17 sure exactly what it's about.

18 MR. MCGUIRE: Okay. Let's mark that as Exhibit
19 4080.

20 (Exhibit 4080 was marked for identification.)

21 MR. KAMMER: 4080.

22 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

23 Q. For identification. It's on the letterhead of
24 the Franchise Tax Board State of California. And it is
25 dated sometime in 1998. Has a response date of May
26 15th -- I can't readily find a date on it. Do you know
27 what the subject matter of this document, as well as the
28 documents attached to it?

197

1 A. I was told by -- and I believe it was from our
2 legal department that the Franchise Tax Board in the
3 State of California wanted information regarding an
4 inventory management process that we put in place called
5 AIM. It stood for advanced inventory management.

6 And there was an incentive program for
7 franchisees to follow this at that time. I don't know
8 why the Franchise Tax Board was interested in this
9 information. They picked this information up out of one
10 of our annual reports and asked us to describe -- to
11 provide some information about it, which, I believe, I
12 did verbally to one of our attorneys. And that's about
13 all I know at this point in time on this.

14 (Whereupon, this ends the testimony deemed
15 confidential and subject to protective order entered by
16 the Superior Court of the County of Los Angeles, State of
17 California.)

18 ////
19 ////
20 ////
21 ////
22 ////
23 ////
24 ////
25 ////
26 ////
27 ////
28 ////

198

1 ////
2 ////

3 (Whereupon, the following testimony is deemed
4 confidential material and subject to protective order
5 entered by the Superior Court of the County of Los
6 Angeles, State of California and is bound separately.)
7 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
8 Q. 794 through 815. What is that document?
9 A. This -- this is the corporate store version of
10 the information package that was sent out when we entered
11 into our three new RDA programs last July with the three
12 companies. Difference being that we don't have
13 participation forms required, et cetera. So it's pretty
14 much the same information, somewhat condensed because of
15 not needing to provide the same kind of material to
16 corporate stores.
17 Q. Am I correct that this describes your RDA
18 program for your corporate stores throughout the country?
19 A. That's correct.
20 MR. MCGUIRE: We'll make this Exhibit 4081,
21 thank you.
22 (Exhibit 4081 was marked for identification).
23 MS. TUCKER: And you said only through page 815
24 or 8 --
25 MR. MCGUIRE: I'm sorry. 794 through --
26 Witness, can you help us?
27 THE WITNESS: 815, but it appears that there may
28 be some pages missing.

200

1 MS. TUCKER: Well, I don't know if some of the
2 subsequent pages maybe should have been attached to it.
3 THE WITNESS: It appears to be.
4 MR. MCGUIRE: If the question from counsel is,
5 should 816 and 817 or 818.
6 MR. KAMMER: If these had been stapled badly,
7 you can start probably tearing them apart without hurting
8 Mr. McGuire's feelings.
9 MR. MCGUIRE: Yeah. They seem to be similar.
10 And counsel makes a good point if this is supposed to be
11 an all-inclusive package.
12 THE WITNESS: I believe this is an all-inclusive
13 package, sir, yes.
14 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
15 Q. Right through page 18 and nothing else needs to
16 be added?
17 A. No, no, no, no. 815 is not complete.
18 Q. All right. Then let's make the exhibit a
19 complete corporate package describing the RDA program
20 with all cigarette manufacturers for all corporate stores
21 in the United States.
22 A. Except for this doesn't belong in there. 843,

23 844, 845, these are copies again of franchise
24 participation form which would not have been in there.
25 Pages 831 through 842, once again, I think are just
26 duplicates of what was in the franchise agreements that
27 we already looked at. This would be, I believe, a
28 complete -- I believe this would be a complete package.

201

1 There's some duplicate pages here.

2 Q. You should --

3 A. I believe this would be a complete package, sir.

4 Q. So that we're complete or final on this, would
5 you or you, Bill -- I don't care who does it. Somebody
6 read into the record what are the Bate numbers for 4081,
7 which is described by the witness as being a complete RDA
8 package with all cigarette manufacturers for the
9 corporate stores in the United States. Did I describe
10 that right?

11 A. Well, no.

12 Q. Would you describe what this is.

13 A. With the exception of the Philip Morris one,
14 which was changed, which is changing July 1st, which
15 we've already reviewed, the new leaders program. The
16 Brown & Williamson and R.J. Reynolds program is in here.

17 MR. KAMMER: Those were the programs as of July
18 1st, '99?

19 THE WITNESS: Yeah. Being changed basically
20 just with the Philip Morris change.

21 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

22 Q. And these run through July 2001?

23 A. No. December -- end of December 2001.

24 Q. Thank you.

25 MR. KAMMER: And the Exhibit 4081 presently
26 consists of Bates numbers 795 -- excuse me -- 794 through
27 830, consecutively.

28 /////

202

1 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

2 Q. Is 831 through 845 duplicates of information
3 that has already been marked as exhibits in our
4 discussions?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Okay. What is 831 through 842?

7 A. This was -- part of this is. I'm sorry. Looks
8 like I used the same information in two different
9 communications. This was basically a communication to my
10 division merchandisers regarding new display fixturing
11 that would be occurring mostly as a result of the new
12 display agreements. And talks about the back --
13 basically, about the back bar fixturing program.

14 Q. What is 843 through 845? Is that a duplication?

15 A. That's a duplication of the participation forms
16 that were in the other package.

17 Q. Okay. Going back to some other documents we
18 didn't get to yet because I was getting -- looks like
19 we're going to make the plane now. 651. What is that
20 document?

21 A. This is part of I think the thing we just looked
22 at.

23 Q. Is the first page the same? Looks like an
24 outline of everything we talked about?

25 A. Yeah.

26 Q. And then the second page looks like it's cut off
27 and it's only --

28 A. Yeah.

203

1 Q. -- part of. So do you know if this should have
2 gone with an exhibit that would have been ending with
3 649?

4 MR. KAMMER: Exhibit 4076? Is that what you're
5 saying?

6 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

7 Q. Let's see. 4076 has 649 as the last page. This
8 document, no matter what we do with it, Bill, is -- just
9 doesn't make any sense because it's -- it ends without a
10 period. It's a partial page.

11 Can you help us, sir? Do you know what the
12 purpose of this document or what it relates to?

13 A. Yes. And I cannot tell you exactly which one of
14 these documents. It gave my division merchandisers once
15 again some of the rationale for the programs that we had
16 come up with as recommended why we weren't participating
17 in a higher level of retail leaders, for example. And
18 I'm not sure that -- because I pulled everything out of
19 my files, I'm not sure that the balance of this document
20 even exists anymore. But the program execution
21 refixturing information, question, answer, action
22 required, are all in prior documents. The only thing
23 that seems to be is a little bit of the rationale that
24 was added.

25 Q. 653 is a one-page document that apparently was
26 part of another document which -- can you identify this?

27 A. Yes. This is -- I believe this is from
28 information that is sent to me from R.J. Reynolds'

204

1 government affairs department. They do a monthly recap,
2 if you will, of legislative action or proposed
3 legislation around the country. The reason is that it's
4 broken up when I get it.

5 If there is more than one state on the page, I
6 make a copy. So I have a page for California if there's
7 something for California; one for Louisiana, if there's
8 something on there for Louisiana. And I kind of review
9 these -- look for possible federal excise tax increases
10 that we need to be aware may be happening, or some kind
11 of new restrictions on counter displays, et cetera, we
12 need to be aware of.

13 Q. The top of the page talks about the business and
14 taxpayers for fair fees coalition. Is that a group
15 sponsored by the tobacco industry?

16 A. I have no idea what this one means. It's just,
17 basically, California stuck in the file, to be honest
18 with you. I think -- I mean, I guess I could tell you
19 what I think it means, if that's okay.

20 Q. Sure.

21 A. I believe there was -- I believe there was a
22 move by the voters -- some voters in California to repeal
23 some of the increases on the cigarette and tobacco taxes.
24 I believe that's what this was.

25 Q. And next group down, it talks about smoking
26 restrictions, marketing, sales, and advertising
27 restrictions, New York and California. What California
28 restrictions are referred to there, if you know?

205

1 A. I don't know because they're not here. They're
2 just saying that this is probably something that will be
3 on the agenda for legislatures in May of those dates.

4 Q. And this document, when it was given to you in
5 total, what was it called, if you know?
6 A. No, I don't know. It also, I believe, has been
7 sent to me as confidential.
8 (Exhibit 4082 was marked for identification.)
9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
10 Q. Mark this as Exhibit 4082. You say marked
11 confidential from whom?
12 A. I believe from the Reynolds people. Not for
13 distribution only to the parties that it's sent to.
14 Q. And the people that it's carbon copied to, do
15 you recognize them as being employees of a tobacco
16 manufacturer?
17 A. The only one I really recognize down here, I
18 think, is Darryl Marsch. I believe he is with Reynolds.
19 Q. What about Byron Nelson WKA? Do you recognize
20 that?
21 A. No, I don't. Byron Nelson, no, I don't.
22 Q. All right. Next are a series of -- well, I
23 don't know if I can go into a series yet. Let's mark as
24 one exhibit two, 654 and 655, 671 through 674. What's
25 our next number there?
26 (Exhibit 4083 was marked for identification).
27 MR. KAMMER: 4083.
28 MR. MCGUIRE: Thank you. 4083 for

206

1 identification.
2 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
3 Q. What are these documents?
4 A. 654 and 655?
5 Q. Yes.
6 A. 654 and 655 is a response to me from John Grover
7 of Brown & Williamson to my request to ensure that if we
8 had any stores that still had counter displays in Los
9 Angeles, that they were converted to nonself-serve
10 displays by, and I forgot what the date was, I believe
11 June 2nd.
12 City of L.A. required or banned all self-service
13 cigarette displays. And most of our stores don't have
14 them. They were in back bars, but we have some stores
15 with physical constraints against back bars. And I
16 wanted to ensure that if we did have counter displays,
17 they were all nonself-serve types. So I notified all
18 three of my national contacts to make sure they followed
19 through, to make sure that was, in fact, done in case.
20 Q. And 671 through 673, does it have to do with the
21 smoking paraphernalia in California?
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. And are the addressees in this -- these are
24 e-mail printouts; is that right?
25 A. That's correct.
26 Q. Are the addressees in this series of documents,
27 671 through 674, all 7-Eleven employees?
28 A. Yes, they are.

207

1 (Exhibit 4084 was marked for identification.)
2 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
3 Q. Okay. Exhibit 4084 for identification is Bates
4 Numbers 656 through 665. And it's from Ronnie Volkening,
5 V-o-l-k-e-n-i-n-g, to Todd McElroy, M-c capital
6 E-l-r-o-y. And you are also a recipient. It's dated
7 January 29, '99. And the subject has to do with taxes on
8 tobacco buy-downs; is that right?

9 A. Yes.
10 Q. How was this resolved, if you know?
11 A. I'm not sure it is resolved.
12 Q. Okay. So it's still -- is it still an issue, as
13 to whether or not the retailer has to pay a tax on the
14 buy-downs?
15 A. Yes, my understanding is still an open issue.
16 Q. Has Southland taken a position on that?
17 A. Yes. I think our position was stated in here.
18 Q. Was that your attorney that appeared as stating
19 the position that there should be no tax?
20 A. If you're referring to Tom McElroy, I'm not sure
21 who *purchased.
22 Q. Mr. Kenney?
23 A. Gosh, I don't know who Mr. Kenney is, no.
24 Q. Did you receive any advice on this from
25 Covington and Burling? By "you," I mean the company.
26 A. I don't know.
27 Q. By "this," I meant the issue, not just this
28 appearance.

208

1 A. I'm sorry. Who's Covington and Burling?
2 Q. Does that not ring a bell with you?
3 A. No.
4 Q. Okay. They're attorneys.
5 A. Huh?
6 Q. They're attorneys.
7 A. Okay.
8 (Exhibit 4085 was marked for identification.)
9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
10 Q. Next 667 through 670 that we marked for
11 identification as Exhibit 4085. What's the source of
12 this document?
13 A. I'm not 100 percent sure in this. I think I
14 know, but I'm not sure.
15 Q. You don't have to be 100 percent sure. Can you
16 tell me probably who it is?
17 A. I believe this was our fellow who was running
18 our head of our tax department thing, Mr. Todd McElroy.
19 I believe this was his -- for lack of a better word, his
20 position statement on it.
21 Q. It's on the same subject as the previous
22 exhibit?
23 A. Yes, it is.
24 Q. Let's go to 4075, a single-page exhibit Activity
25 Report.
26 MR. KAMMER: 675. 4086, right.
27 (Exhibit 4086 was marked for identification.)
28 ////

209

1 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
2 Q. 4086 for identification, it doesn't have a date
3 on it. Do you know what this document is?
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. What is it?
6 A. This is, I guess, for lack of a better word, an
7 obstacle that was brought to our attention. And that we
8 had purchased equipment for all the stores in California
9 to be able to scan driver's license bar codes, in order
10 to assist in identifying the fact that persons buying
11 cigarettes were of age. And apparently the new driver's
12 license does not carry that same bar code anymore. So we
13 look at it as a step backwards.

14 Q. Was the idea being that you would also scan
15 everybody driver's license that bought cigarettes so that
16 the tax authority would know how much -- how many
17 cigarettes were being bought, or was it limited only to
18 minors that were going to be scanned?
19 A. Well, I think we were going to -- I mean, our
20 directions to the stores were -- are basically to -- if
21 you -- if you think -- if they appear to be less than 25
22 or 26, I believe is the -- I believe is the age that was
23 said. If it looked to be 26, make sure you ask for
24 identification. And then in California, since we could
25 scan that, it helps the person do the math in their
26 minds. They don't have to figure out how old they are,
27 you know, the birth date says this much, take away this
28 much. Because for some of our people that gets to be a
210

1 challenge.
2 Q. Who is R.L. Mozingo, M-o-z-i-n-g-o?
3 A. I don't know.
4 MS. LONG: Are we on a different exhibit now?
5 MR. KAMMER: Next page.
6 MR. MCGUIRE: The next Exhibit 4087 for
7 identification will be a combination of Bates 676, 677,
8 678 through 683 and 690 through 691. They're all from
9 Mr. R.L. Mozingo, and they all go to T.J. Payne,
10 P-a-y-n-e.
11 (Exhibit 4087 was marked for identification).
12 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
13 Q. Who is Mr. Payne?
14 A. I don't know.
15 Q. Where did this information come from?
16 A. This comes to me from Jean I. Swisher, from R.J.
17 Reynolds.
18 Q. So is it your understanding that these two
19 individuals probably work for R.J. Reynolds?
20 A. I would -- that's probably a good assumption.
21 Yeah, I'm not sure but --
22 Q. Okay. And why did Ms. Swisher -- it is Ms.
23 Swisher, right?
24 A. Mrs.
25 Q. Mrs. Swisher?
26 A. Yeah.
27 Q. Not Mr. Swisher?
28 A. No.

211
1 Q. Where did they receive this information, if you
2 know?
3 A. Where did Mrs. Swisher get it?
4 Q. Yes.
5 A. I believe she gets it from within their company,
6 from their government affairs department, I believe.
7 Q. And is the subject matter of this all
8 legislative regulations on the sale of cigarettes?
9 A. Yes.
10 Q. Or cigarette materials?
11 A. Yes.
12 Q. What's the purpose of them sending this to you,
13 if you know?
14 A. Information sharing, and also, you know, so that
15 we can be aware of possible pending new legislation that
16 requires our action in order to be in compliance.
17 (Whereupon, this ends the testimony deemed
18 confidential and subject to protective order entered by

19 the Superior Court of the County of Los Angeles, State of
20 California.)
21 /////
22 /////
23 /////
24 /////
25 /////
26 /////
27 /////
28 /////

212

1 /////
2 /////
3 /////
4 /////
5 /////
6 /////
7 /////
8 /////
9 /////
10 /////
11 /////
12 /////
13 /////
14 /////
15 /////
16 /////
17 /////
18 /////
19 /////
20 /////
21 /////

22 (Whereupon, the following testimony is deemed
23 confidential material and subject to protective order
24 entered by the Superior Court of the County of Los
25 Angeles, State of California and is bound separately.)
26 BY MR. MCGUIRE:

27 Q. Take a look through that and tell me if these
28 documents, e-mails, cover sheets, all have to do with

213

1 restrictions on the sale of cigarettes in various
2 jurisdictions.

3 A. No. The last one, 743 through 754, once again,
4 go back to the tax issue again of July 1st, the
5 California increase on other tobacco products.

6 Q. Okay. Other than that, this still stay as part
7 of this exhibit?

8 A. Yes, they do deal with either smoking
9 restrictions or -- I'm sorry. What did you call them?

10 Q. I said regulations or restrictions on the sale
11 of cigarettes.

12 A. As well as smoking restrictions in general,
13 which are just on the same document.

14 Q. Where did you get these documents from?

15 A. They come from a variety of sources. Some come
16 from R.J. Reynolds, some come from Philip Morris, some
17 come from McLanes Wholesale, and some come from our
18 government affairs department.

19 Q. Do you get these in the normal course of
20 business?

21 A. I would assume I get a fair amount of them. I'm
22 not sure I get them all. I probably combined -- I have,
23 probably -- considering I get them from cigarette

24 companies, I probably get more than anybody else.
25 Q. Do you read them?
26 A. I look at the ones -- I scan them and look at
27 the ones that are -- you know, apply. Like smoking
28 restrictions, quite frankly, I really don't pay much
214
1 attention to those. I'm more interested in something
2 that might require us to take some action in terms of how
3 we display merchandise, et cetera.
4 Q. Well, do you consider the statements made in
5 these various ordinances and laws, with respect to the
6 manner and method in which 7-Eleven, Incorporated,
7 markets cigarette products?
8 A. Could you repeat that? Do I do what?
9 Q. Do you consider the statements made in these
10 documents in determining the manner and method in which
11 7-Eleven, Incorporated, will market and sell cigarette
12 products?
13 A. Well, certainly, if any of these regulations are
14 going to enforce, of course we do, yes.
15 Q. For example, I'm now looking at page 697, where
16 it says the Supreme Court -- and this is a California
17 ordinance. "Supreme Court has repeatedly recognized that
18 children and minors deserve special solicitude because
19 they lack the ability to assess and fully analyze the
20 information presented through commercial advertising."
21 How do you take that into consideration when you market
22 cigarettes?
23 A. Well, no. My note on here says pages 3 and 5
24 for the key parts and the restrictions, that these are
25 the requirements I'm following -- I'm following the
26 requirements that are imposed.
27 Q. Okay. Is that how you take into effect the
28 facts that are stated in the preamble or purpose of the
215
1 -- of this particular statute or ordinance?
2 MS. TUCKER: Objection; lacks foundation.
3 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
4 Q. Go ahead.
5 A. The prohibition is a result of the preamble. So
6 I'm following the prohibition.
7 Q. Does the company agree with that statement that
8 the Supreme Court has made?
9 A. I don't know. Do I agree with that?
10 Q. No. The company.
11 A. The company. I couldn't say.
12 Q. Who would I ask in the -- who would know whether
13 the company agrees or not?
14 A. I couldn't tell you that.
15 Q. Do you know if you have any stores within 1,000
16 feet of any residential zone, residential use, school,
17 religious institution, entertainment park, youth center,
18 or public park playground in the state of California?
19 A. I assume we do, yes.
20 Q. In those places, have you advised both the
21 franchisees and the corporation that they're not allowed
22 to have a sign that advertises tobacco products that can
23 be seen from the outside?
24 MR. KAMMER: Objection; assumes facts not in
25 evidence. This is not a statewide regulation.
26 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
27 Q. Let me limit the question to the city of Los
28 Angeles.

1 A. I did -- I did provide the notification to our
2 division, yes, that these are regulations we need to
3 follow.
4 Q. Do you know if you've complied with them yet?
5 A. Personally?
6 Q. Yeah.
7 A. Knowledge? No. I have no personal knowledge of
8 it.
9 Q. Who would know whether the corporation has
10 complied with the law yet in the corporation?
11 A. Once again, my -- probably my first place to go
12 would be to the division manager.
13 Q. That's the lady that's been in the job for two
14 weeks?
15 A. Yeah. Or the market managers.
16 Q. Wouldn't your superior know, since he was in the
17 job up until two weeks ago? He had the Southern
18 California marketing managership before -- up to two
19 weeks ago; isn't that right? Jeff?
20 A. Jeff Hamill.
21 Q. What was it?
22 A. Would we have personal knowledge of each and
23 every store complied?
24 Q. Yeah.
25 A. I'm not sure.
26 Q. What is the corporation doing to see or to
27 determine whether or not it is in compliance, if
28 anything?

1 A. I don't know.
2 Q. Let me read to you from page 707. Does the
3 company agree that the tobacco industry affectively
4 targets children and youth to start to smoke through
5 advertising and marketing of promotional items?
6 A. No.
7 Q. What do you base that denial on?
8 A. Once again, are you asking me as a
9 representative of the company?
10 Q. Yes, sir.
11 A. I see no evidence thereof.
12 Q. What evidence have you looked at?
13 A. Point of purchase, advertising.
14 Q. Anything else?
15 A. No.
16 Q. Does the company agree that every day in the
17 United States 3,000 children become smokers, including
18 300 children and youth in California?
19 A. I don't know that.
20 Q. Do you have any information that would indicate
21 that that's a false statement?
22 A. No.
23 Q. Do you agree that the surgeon general and the
24 California Department of Health Services have found that,
25 although illegally, children can easily buy cigarettes
26 and other tobacco products over the counter through
27 self-service displays and vending machines?
28 A. No.

1 Q. Is this one of the reasons why you have
2 eliminated self-service displays in your stores, or
3 you're in the process of doing that?
4 A. No.

5 MS. LONG: Object.
6 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
7 Q. 716, I know I saw that name before. Byron
8 Nelson, WKA, Winston-Salem. Does that indicate to you
9 that he's an employee of R.J. Reynolds tobacco?
10 A. Sure appears to be. Yes, sir.
11 Q. 717, an ordinance in the town or municipality of
12 Walnut Creek says -- or states that no manufacturer,
13 distributor or retailer of tobacco products may -- and it
14 goes on. First question I have is, are -- is 7-Eleven,
15 Incorporated, a manufacturer, distributor, or retailer of
16 tobacco products?
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. Okay. It says that you shall not "sell or cause
19 to be marketed, licensed, distributed or sold any item or
20 service to a minor which bears the brand name, logo,
21 symbol, motto, selling message, recognizable color or
22 pattern of colors, or any other indicia, or product
23 identification identical with or similar to or
24 identifiable with those used for any brand of tobacco
25 product." What are you doing to make sure that that
26 doesn't happen --
27 MR. KAMMER: I'm going to object to the
28 following.

219

1 MR. MCGUIRE: -- if anything?
2 MR. KAMMER: Objection; it assumes --
3 foundation. It assumes the company has a store in Walnut
4 Creek.
5 THE WITNESS: We do not have any such items
6 listed as available.
7 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
8 Q. The 1-800 Marlboro signs, wouldn't they qualify?
9 A. I don't think so. I don't know.
10 Q. Can you get logo items, Marlboro cigarettes by
11 calling 1800 Marlboro?
12 MS. LONG: Objection; calls for speculation.
13 THE WITNESS: I don't know.
14 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
15 Q. Is this article identical to the requirements of
16 the Master Settlement Agreement?
17 A. I don't know.
18 Q. Have you ever seen the Master Settlement
19 Agreement?
20 A. I believe I've seen it. Yes, sir.
21 Q. Have you ever seen what portion, or has someone
22 told you what portions they believe apply to 7-Eleven, if
23 any?
24 A. There's been some conversation that you cannot
25 have a -- a value-added purchase with a brand name of a
26 cigarette on it, like a cap or T-shirt.
27 Q. Do you get, or do you obtain, 7-Eleven obtain, a
28 special license to sell cigarettes?

220

1 A. I don't know.
2 Q. Is there a tobacco retailer's license in the
3 state of California?
4 A. I don't know.
5 Q. Who in the company would know, and would know
6 whether you have one or not?
7 A. Either our legal department, or probably our --
8 legal department, I guess, would be a good start.
9 Q. Do you have a store in Walnut Creek?

10 A. I believe we do.
11 Q. Do you know if that store has a retail
12 license --
13 A. I do not.
14 Q. -- retail license to sell tobacco products?
15 A. I do not, no.
16 Q. If the store in Walnut Creek does not have a
17 license to sell tobacco products, and they sell tobacco
18 products, would that be an unlawful act in your mind?
19 MS. LONG: Objection; calls for a legal
20 conclusion.
21 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. Does this call for
22 them to have a license? Is that what this is?
23 MR. MCGUIRE: Yes.
24 MS. TUCKER: Also lacks foundation.
25 THE WITNESS: If a store is supposed to have a
26 license to sell tobacco, and they don't have a license to
27 sell tobacco, I would consider that an unlawful act,
28 yeah.

221

1 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
2 Q. Do you know where the city of Lawndale is?
3 A. No, I don't.
4 Q. Does the company -- I'm now reading from page
5 731. I won't read it into record, but would you go to
6 that page?
7 MR. KAMMER: What's the page?
8 MR. MCGUIRE: 731.
9 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
10 Q. And I cannot read the document or the
11 handwriting on the document, as I indicated earlier in
12 several other ones, but I do think I see your Tom B in
13 the upper right-hand corner. Would you confirm that
14 that's what --
15 A. Yes, sir.
16 Q. Does that indicate that you've read this
17 ordinance?
18 A. Yes.
19 Q. Did you understand it or did you have to get --
20 did you understand the ordinance when you read it, or
21 believe you understood it?
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. Have you done anything with respect to the
24 stores that are in Scotts Valley to comply with this
25 ordinance?
26 A. Scotts Valley? Where is Scotts Valley?
27 MR. KAMMER: I think we're mixing up two
28 documents, but I'll let you ask the question. The cover

222

1 memo is one city and the document beginning at 731 is
2 Scotts Valley.
3 MR. MCGUIRE: What cover memo?
4 MR. KAMMER: You started with reference to the
5 city of Lawndale, and there's a preceding page. I don't
6 think they're the same. I don't know where either one of
7 them is.
8 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
9 Q. The ordinance has to do with Scotts Valley, and
10 that's the one you signed, right?
11 A. Yes. Well, no. Both.
12 Q. You signed them both? Where did you receive
13 this particular ordinance from?
14 A. The one from city of Lawndale?

15 Q. Yes. I'm sorry, no. The Scotts Valley one.
16 A. I'm not sure where this one came from.
17 Q. Does your handwriting indicate that Scotts
18 Valley is in California?
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. And did you read the entire ordinance?
21 A. I generally look for restrictions and action
22 that we need to take.
23 Q. Do you generally skip over the other information
24 that's stated in the ordinance?
25 A. I look for what it is that we need to do to be
26 in compliance.
27 Q. Do you know if any of the information on page 2
28 of this ordinance is accurate?

223

1 A. No, I don't.
2 Q. Have you requested any information from the
3 tobacco industry as to whether or not the information is
4 accurate?
5 A. I'm sorry.
6 Q. Information such as the industry spent 5.1
7 billion on advertising in 1996?
8 A. No.
9 Q. In California alone the tobacco industry spent
10 1.3 million in advertising and promotion per day in 1995
11 and approximately 32.7 million on billboard advertising
12 in 1996. Do you have any reason to believe that that
13 information is incorrect?
14 A. No.
15 Q. Then there's a number of attributions to
16 different tobacco companies from documents they're
17 quoting from these documents. Do you know if R.J.
18 Reynolds was the source of this particular document --
19 MS. LONG: Objection; calls for speculation.
20 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
21 Q. -- provided the document to you?
22 A. No. If I go back to the first page, maybe I
23 can --
24 (Discussion off the record.)
25 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
26 Q. My copy of the document says that this was sent
27 to you by R.J.R. public issues on September 23, 1999, at
28 3:59 p.m.?

224

1 A. I'm sorry. Where are you at, sir?
2 Q. I'm on page --
3 A. Okay. Okay. I missed that. Okay. That's
4 where it came from. Okay. Well, I'm assuming that it
5 was sent directly to me from them. I don't know. I
6 don't think --
7 MR. KAMMER: I think that you'll assume that you
8 sent it to someone at that time, but he doesn't know if
9 it's to him.
10 THE WITNESS: It may have been sent to Jeanne
11 and she forwarded it to me. I don't know.
12 BY MR. MCGUIRE:
13 Q. Has R.J.R. public issues ever denied any of the
14 attributions to it on this page?
15 A. I don't know.
16 Q. Have they denied any of the attributions made
17 throughout this document?
18 A. I don't know.
19 MR. KAMMER: I'm going to object to the line of

20 questioning at this point, Mickey. It's beyond the scope
21 of the deposition and instruct the witness not to answer.
22 MR. MCGUIRE: Is this all one?
23 MR. KAMMER: Yes. You've marked everything
24 through page something or other. 541 as exhibit --
25 excuse me. Everything through 754 has been marked as
26 4088.

27 (Whereupon, this ends the testimony deemed
28 confidential and subject to protective order entered by

225

1 the Superior Court of the County of Los Angeles, State of
2 California.)

3 ////
4 ////
5 ////
6 ////
7 ////
8 ////
9 ////
10 ////
11 ////
12 ////
13 ////
14 ////
15 ////
16 ////
17 ////
18 ////
19 ////
20 ////
21 ////
22 ////
23 ////
24 ////
25 ////
26 ////
27 ////
28 ////

226